

## COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF EDUCATIONAL POLICIES OF PAKISTAN

*Muhammad Aslam Kamboh  
Dr.Saleha Parveen*

### ABSTRACT

*The aim of this paper is to analyse the educational policies introduced in British India in relation to post-partition policies formulated in Pakistan. Major education policy documents of Pakistan were identified to summarize and tabulate for indicating similarities & variations. These education policy documents are focussed on promoting diversity in education. However, these documents were found significantly varying on the mode of education and implementation to flout proportionately balanced diversified education.*

---

**Keywords:** Educational Policies, Colonial Policies, Formulation and Implementation

### INTRODUCTION

Policy is concerned with the “formulation, determination and identification of the will and purpose of business organization” (Thomas J. Mc. Nicholas, 1977:3). In that context Educational policy is “an organized mental framework with the general goals, norms and principles contained in the social philosophy of a given society” (Sikandar Hayat, 2000:37).

Pakistan as a progressive ideological state derives her social philosophy from both contemporary needs as well as from freedom struggle and movement, which was stimulated from all walks of life including education leading towards independence. Education Policies of Pakistan retail both perspectives to justify the new policy each time, therefore all it warrants a comparative analysis, as a whole.

Pakistan has a long record of policy making and growth in the sector of education, extending over more than six decades. A full description of the policy development on education would involve going so far back in the history to trace the concept development on each issue and aspect of education, that would certainly be beyond the scope of this study, and in many ways repetitive of what has been published in numerous articles, papers and books produced on the subject. For this reason this study was limited to the range of objectives of education struggled for through various pre-independence education movements and post-independence education policies as a whole adopted to build a forward looking and progressing nation.

As disagreement exists among the educationists and policy makers over the number of documents to be given status of education policy, therefore this study is limited to those policy documents which are taken without any exception by all with the policy status (Manzoor-ul-Haq, 2006).

For this comparative analysis, Pre-Independence Muslim Education Movements and Post-Independence Policy documents on Education of Pakistan were searched out and explored for summarized objectives and then, those were phrased in an historical order to induce the drift or project the consensus of thought on education as it appears from this document research study.

#### **POLICY DOCUMENTS**

1. Report of the Commission on National Education ( 1959)
2. The new Education Policy (March 1970)
3. The Educational Policy 1972 – 80
4. National Education Policy and implementation Program 1979
5. National Education Policy 1992
6. National Educational Policy Iqra's 1998 – 2010

#### **OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY**

The objectives of this study were:

- Understanding those changes that had occurred in vision on education in Pakistan.
- Understanding the present status of educational vision reflected from various policies.
- Providing an information base for decision – making to executive administrators, educates and teachers and to enable them to add their value judgments, so that policy and practices are firmly based on empirical evidence.

#### **METHODOLOGY**

For the comparative analysis pre-independence Muslim thought on education and post – independence education policy documents of Pakistan were explored to identify whether there was other Islam progressive concept of education in the society, which now constitutes Pakistan. In this order, objectives of education struggles by Muslim educational movements and the objectives protracted by the past policy documents were summarized and phrased in a historical order of their emergence to induce the course of direction of the thought on education in the past as it appears from this documents research study and to make suggestions (Manzoor-ul-Haq, 2006).

As such this comparative analysis was structured around the following main questions:

- What was ideological base of education under different policies in Pakistan?
- What was Islamic values and concepts suggested to be promised through education under each policy?
- What other than Islamic religious education were suggested under each policy?
- To summering these objectives of each document in this context and to draw conclusion expect guidance was solicited b personally approaching identified convenient sample of experts and to draw conclusion.

#### **ISLAM AND SECULAR EDUCATION**

Holy Quran encourages the humankind to conquer and benefit from the nature, as to increase productivity, improve quality of life through comprehending and conquering the processes of the nature. In the areas of physical and biological sciences and reminds those processes as his blessing for the making in walk of life by retailing from the nature to learn enlightened everlasting concepts on home, family, state administration, community, ummah, trade, commerce, vocation, technology, engineering , warfare etc.

For harnessing, the force of nature and developing the personality of the humans and further Manzoor-ul-Haque (2006:29) writes, “Gains control were the forces of the physical world and keep open his achievements. According to the laws of Allah, for the good and well-being of the humankind at large, have all that is required to maintain life. But without off shell can never develop into a chicken, lead a corporate life and establish a social order in which the physical needs of every individual shall be adequately met and he shall full opportunity and means for the developments of this personality”.

#### **MUSLIM EDUCATIONAL MOVEMENTS IN BRITISH INDIA**

Muslim educational movements were started in the subcontinent to uplift Muslim education. These movements led to the creation of new educational instructions.

##### **A) Dar-ul-Uloom Deoband (1867)**

A house of learning founded in Deoband (UP) in 1867 by Mulana Muhammad Qasim Nanawtawi. The school in one way was the continuation of Madrassah-e-Rahimia Dehli, many of the traditions set by Shah Waliullah and Shah Abdul Aziz, and to counterpoise Syed Ahmed Khan’s west oriented movements. The objectives were:

- a) To make India a great country of Asia from all points of view,

- b) To make India a federal state by uniting local States, and
- c) To introduce a uniform law over her to ensure social-economic justice to all.

The religious manifesto was as under:

- a) Defending Islamic conduct, behaviour, traditions and Islamic patriotism and nationalism.
- b) Struggling for attaining and safeguarding the universal religious and nationwide rights of Muslims.
- c) Struggling to establish fine gracious relations with the non-Muslim community nationwide to the extent Shariat-Islamiyah permit's, and
- d) Struggling for the independence of the country and religious convictions according to the objectives of Sharia.

### **B) Mohammadan Anglo-Oriental College (MAO) Aligarh (1877)**

It was the movement, which led by Sir Syed Ahmed Khan Aligarh College and had the objectives as under:

- a) To impart western education to Indian Muslims.
- b) To reject the deceptive conduct of the past, that had stalled the progress of Muslims
- c) To reinvent oriental cumulative knowledge with the help of western creative writing and science.
- d) To produce beacon of light in the eastern dreaming minds of the eastern for the practical knowledge of the west.
- e) To elevate importance of Muslims of India as a useful and loyal assistants to the British crown.
- f) To develop attitudes of appreciation for good government instead of hostility towards the alien rule.

Sir Syed Ahmed Khan founded "Muhammadan Educational Conference", a forum for discussing problems that affect the Muslims at large. It gave an idea about some of the problems in education sector, as:

- a) To ask the help of Muslims Anjumans (local associations) for scholarships for needy students.
- b) To make an appeal to the government that Muslims in government schools should have an opportunity of receiving religious instructions.
- c) To urge the Allahabad University to exclude from its curriculum Cox's history that contained chapters' offensive to Muslims.
- d) To oblige every Muslim to one percent of his income for the diffusion of western knowledge amongst the Muslims of his district.

**C) Nadwa-tul-Ulema, Luchknow (1892)**

It was the middle path between Deoband (old knowledge reviving Institutions) and Aligrah (western knowledge spreading institution) and an attempt to represent all sects of the Muslims was founded by Moulana Shibli Nomani and Molvi Abdul Ghafoor (Deputy Collector) at Kanpur.

The objectives of it were as under:

- a. To reform MAKTABS, develop religious learning, improve the moral and help cultivate polished behaviour.
- b. To resolve and settle down the differences of opinion among the ULMA and provide complete restraint on the expression of divergent point of view.
- c. To give thought and devise ways and means for the general welfare of the Muslims, but to keep them away from politics and the affairs of the state.
- d. To establish meaningful academy of leaning where technical education could be provided along with academic education.
- e. To spread Islam through Tabligh and to establish a Department of Afta (to give Fatwa/Judgment).

**D) Anjuman Himayat-e-Islam, Lahore (1884)**

It was formed by people of Punjab to encounter the hostilities of Christian missionaries and Arya Samaj in Punjab and India. Khalifa Hameeduddin was first elected president of it. The Anjuman had following main objectives:

- a) Enabling Muslims to protect their religion through enriched knowledge and might not give-up or fall in the align hands while interacting with the peoples of other religions.
- b) Enabling Muslims to defend Islam in their mass discussions and academic writings rationally and intelligently.
- c) To establish educational institutions for Muslims in which old and new system of education were to be taught.
- d) Preparing Muslims to take responsibility of Muslim poor girls and boys and orphans for their education and maintenance to make them usable citizen of the society.
- e) Improving relations between different sects of Islam to improve conditions of Muslims community socially, morally and intellectually.
- f) Harvesting advantages of loyalty extended by the Muslims to the British Government.

**E) Sindh Madrassah-tul-Islam, Karachi (1885)**

It was founded by Aga Hassan Ali Afandi for the educational advancement of the Muslims of Sindh on the new modern lines. It had

English principal and Mir of Khairpur state had promised to pay the salary of the principal if he belonged to England. Madrasah provided good education at low cost. Founder of Pakistan had received his early education in this institution.

**F) Islamia College Peshawar (1890)**

Basic concepts, principles and objectives were the same as were those of Anjuman Himayat-e-Islam, Lahore.

**EDUCATIONAL POLICIES AFTER INDEPENDENCE**

***A) Educational Policies in 1959***

The Objectives of Educational System proposed under this report were:

- 1) Overriding objective was Nation building in such a way as by changing minds and its reflection in national behaviour and public outlook towards government and governance. Report highlights the need for bringing change in mind set of the people of an independent country to revolutionize attitudes in such a way as the “cynicism, lethargy, opportunism, suspicion, dishonestly, and indifference” may be changed with “sprit of individual initiative, personal integrity, pride in accomplishment, trust in one’s fellow men, and a private sense of public duty”. Report opinions all this will be achieved through development optimism. Positive outlook and conduct which is consistent our own aspirations developed during the freedom struggle and developing work habit of ‘imaginatively and energetically moving towards the solution of their social and economic problems’, and ‘encourage business community to assume a role of national leadership’ through emphasizing quality in education as to find out place in highly competitive world.
- 2) Meeting collective and individual aspirations and needs of the people of this country using instrumental value of the education to develop trained manpower, educated citizenry and leadership to enable them to lead their public lives productively and to their full extent. This will pave the way for the creation of progressive and democratic society.
- 3) Ideals which led to creation of Pakistan must be prepared through system of education and strengthen the concept of unified nation. Islamic spiritual and moral values of Islam must be made strength of Pakistan and inspire our educational system.
- 4) Education system should strive and struggle to create a social welfare state considering public financing in education as an investment in economic to produce professionals for various walks of life including Engineering, Technical and Vocational, commercial and agriculture

education with an ability to utilize the products of our soil, and natural resources.

- 5) Creation of a democratic society and by providing scholarships and awards to those who are best equipped to profit from education in a situation where scholarship cannot be provided for all.
- 6) Introduction into curricula courses in handwork, simple agriculture and workshop practice, to awaken sense of dignity of labour and develop intellectual abilities, spiritual, character, moral values.

### ***B) Educational Policies in 1970***

Policy writes education process would be considered important only when it would have been meeting the ideological and cultural demands of the nation through universalizing human knowledge structures and human progress concepts. The ideological framework is provided by the basic values stressed in Islam including those of social justice, equality and a democratic way of life, which are universal in character and also integral to the concept of Pakistan. The study of Islam should reflect its inherent creativity and dynamism. It should serve as a motive force in promoting the fullest possible development of human potentialities and in engendering the spirit of research and enquiry enjoined by Islam. The educational system should also emphasise attitudes of social responsibility and commitment as the corner stone of the Islamic way of life. It should also inform and educate people in their distinct national heritage and emphasize social and cultural harmony, and a peaceful and orderly evolution of a democratic society. Therefore, Education has to be understood as continuous and lifelong activity available to all sections of the population and the only valid basis of differentiation should be merit and achievement. Also, there should be a concept of education as an instrument of social change and development and as a factor in the creation of a democratic social order by ensuring an equal access to education and training as a critical input in the economic effort of the nation.

Policy opines that, all these concepts on education demands, 'broadening rapidly the base of education with a view to attaining the ideal of universally literate and productive society and on the other, ensure a continuous supply of highly trained persons capable of providing imaginative and creative leadership in different of national activity. As a step in this direction the educational programme will have to be so articulated with elements of practical arts and an emphasis on the dignity of labour that a large number can be channelled to technical and vocational education at each level. It is particularly important the vast numbers their formal education at the elementary level are equipped with necessary skills and attitudes so that they can be gainfully employed with necessary skills and attitudes so that they can be gainfully employed in the economy of the community and

contribute towards its development. To ensure such education, policy opines, 'quality is most certainly the central factor in any concept of education where education is regarded as a process of qualitative change aiming at the development of the innate abilities of an individual'. Moreover, for students policy emphasizes facilities of residential accommodation, an adequate supply of low cost text books, transportation for day scholars, and financial assistance for those who are economically handicapped. Future plans of educational development should pay due attention to all these factors and ensure an adequate investment in student amenities (Govt. of Pakistan, 1972).

***C) Another Educational Policy was introduced during 1972-1980***

**OBJECTIVES**

- 1) Protecting, promoting and practicing the ideology of Pakistan and to make it code of life at all levels.
- 2) Developing national cohesion via strengthening social and cultural harmony on lines of ideology of Pakistan by using educational process consciously.
- 3) Developing an individual's personality in such an educational environment where by he/she can be enabled to face the truth of life emerging from objective study of reality, and understand the need of technological and sociological changes with openness and showing concern for improvement of society.
- 4) Youth mobilization for leadership roles through involving students in community outreach programs of social and environmental importance and to infuse in them dignity of labour.
- 5) Improving on literacy rate by adopting universalized elementary and massive adult education programmes.
- 6) Equalizing education access by creating special facilities have-nots, special children and women in all areas in general and underdeveloped areas in particular.
- 7) Equalizing access to education through provision of special facilities for women, underprivileged groups and mentally retarded and physically handicapped children and adults across the board in hook and nook of the country in general and backward areas in particular.
- 8) Realizing the change and changing needs of the country in line with basic ideology of this country, curriculum might be designed in such a way as to shift from mere general education to a more technical, vocational and scientific education.
- 9) Designing scheme of studies and structure of education in such a way as general and technical education might be integrated and student be

facilitated in opting transfer from one course of study to another of his/her own choice.

- 10) Making provision of academic independence possible within the limitation of national objectives and their other requirements.
- 11) Ensuring the participatory role of all stake holders in the matters of education at all levels.
- 12) Improving on the indicators of dignity and promoting sense of responsibility among teachers and students.
- 13) Preparing students for self-learning and continuing education.
- 14) Discouraging prejudices from the society in its all forms and shapes (Govt. of Pakistan, 1972).

### ***Educational Policies 1979-80***

The objectives of this policy were:

- a) Fostering deep abiding loyalty to Islam and Pakistan and thereby promoting unity of outlook for spiritual and ideological identity and believe in justice and fair play in the minds and hearts of the people of Pakistan in general and the students in particular.
- b) Planting sense of one Nation and concept of Ummah in the hearts and minds of the students of Pakistan and preparing each student to contribute willingly in the welfare of the each fellow Muslim globally.
- c) Creating deeply rooted awareness about the Movement of Pakistan and unshakable loyalty with its culture, history and ideology in such a way as to feel proud to be citizen of an Islamic State.
- d) Character building, conduct and motivation in accordance with the teachings of Islam and behaving like a true Muslim.
- e) Equalizing educational opportunities for all citizens of Pakistan and facilitating minorities for development of their cultural and religious heritage as to enable them effectively participate in the development of Pakistan.
- f) Making provision of diversified talent based quality education by arranging and rearranging trainings and retraining of individuals in such a way as to develop originality of thinking of each student to make him/her realize their potential and exhibit effective capability in managing natural, social and productive forces constituent with the value system of Islam.
- g) Making provisions of maintaining minimum levels acceptable functional literacy and fundamental education for all citizens of Pakistan irrespectively of their cast, colour and creed across the board to enable each individual to participate fully in the efforts of national development to the best of their potential.

- h) Constituting such an environment where each individual may be enthused for lifelong learning and education.
- i) Constituting a self-reliant environment in education for socio economic growth and secure future of the nation by promoting scientific, technical, vocational education in all forms and at all levels (Govt. of Pakistan 1979).

### ***Educational Policies in 1990's***

Objectives of the policy were:

- 1) Creating forward looking, enlightened and Islam Practicing Muslim Society through restructuring the existing system of education.
- 2) Developing sense of Ummah, Muslim world view and its culture strengthening through the teaching of Islamic Social Sciences.
- 3) Developing ball of fire abilities of students in such a way as they may have balanced outlook about the man and nature; contribute in the economic and social uplift of the Ummah generally and country particularly and defend ideology of Pakistan at all forums nationally and internationally for multiple development of Pakistan.
- 4) Promoting national harmony and cohesion by equalizing opportunities of education for all.
- 5) Increasing and ensuring children participation rate 100 percent in primary education by the year 2002. Illiteracy might be eradicated by applying the formal and non-formal approaches.
- 6) Special attention will be paid to the development of female education throughout the country and formal and non-formal methods will be applied in this regard, however female education of rural areas will be given special attention.
- 7) Quality of education will be improved through the (a) revision of curricula; (b) improving physical facilities; (c) applying modern methods of teaching at all the levels; (d) using Media extensively for the purpose of education; (e) promoting research in universities among all disciplines generally and particularly in science and technology.
- 8) Higher education will be converted into seats of learning to promote academic knowledge by democratizing their culture within the framework of national objectives.
- 9) Teachers will be given incentives and awards to bring up their status in the society and to promote sense of responsibility and professionalism in letter and spirit through the accountability by the community.
- 10) New emerging technologies needed for industry might be brought into limelight while redesigning and expanding professional education including technical, vocational and engineering education.

- 11) Moral, physical and social abilities of the youth might be developed through the use of sports, cultural and recreational activities at all levels.
- 12) Private sector might be encouraged to participate in the education system living within the parameters set in this National Education Policy.
- 13) Students might be encouraged for independent learning so as to prepare them for continuing education throughout their life.
- 14) Community participation in matters of education might be ensured and in return students might be prepared through the outreach programs to play their role in solving the problems of the community on their best.
- 15) Prejudice, sectarianism, superstitions, fanaticism and consumerism in their all forms might be discouraged (Govt. of Pakistan, 1992).

#### ***D) National Educational Policy Iqra'a 1998-2010***

##### **VISION OF THE POLICY**

This education policy recognizes the instrumental value of education in imparting cognitive, physical, moral and ideological training to the individuals of the society so as to enable them realize purpose of their life and equip with necessary knowledge and skills to achieve this purpose. Policy states, Education is an instrument which is utilized for spiritual development and material fulfilment of the human needs. Policy opines, Islam also recognizes instrumental value of education and advocates its use for the development of righteous attitudes of the individuals in line with the teachings of Holy Quran and Sunnah to build an Islamic society.

- Appreciating this vision this policy claims this vision would transform the Pakistan into an integrated society which might enable the nation to collectively meet the challenges of 21<sup>st</sup> century. Policy dreams an economically prosperous, politically united, morally sound and spiritually elevated nation.
- Policy dreams true practicing Muslims who is courageous to meet the challenges of next millennium with tolerance, wisdom and confidence.
- Policy also dreamed application of formal and non-formal approached to Universalizing primary education.
- Policy dreamed demand oriented system instead of supply oriented system of education. In this regards policy proposed diversified secondary education, uniform system of education and ensuring development of a curriculum as continuous process.
- Policy suggests improvement of technical education in such as it may enhance technical graduate's employment chances. It might be done by converting static technical education into work-market demanded education.

- Policy proposed Popularization of information technology among children of all ages.
- Policy proposed encouragement of the private sector to reserve certain percentage of their total enrolment for poor student's free education.
- Policy proposed improvement in teaching, learning and research in the higher education institutions so as to meet quality benchmark in the international perspectives (Govt. of Pakistan, 1998).

### COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS

All the education policy documents of Pakistan have verbalized the same construct that is preserving the ideology and ideals the created Pakistan and made her a success story through education, but faulted to visualized implementation strategy which would have raised the teacher to the status of a role model for the students morally, religiously, academically and scholarly and from values – oriented concept of life, That is why Kamal ( 2006:5) opined Pakistan has had better policies than India but instability has not allowed their proper implementation”.

It could have done by making a policy on “commandments for the teacher: the teacher Code of ethics” including list of “thou shall not” act education throughout your professional carrier within the school and outside the school (Jonson, Daily *Dawn* 18/11/2000) no mechanism is suggested in any policy or plan to gauge and measure the public uproar and its impact on the school where ever it is possible. Policy documents failed to visualize an effective mechanism to develop liaison between school and community.

In the same way each policy document enumerates all the characteristics of a quality curriculum but the state of its designing and devilmint the workforce assigned the responsibility fell lack of required skills, knowledge, training, confidence, finance and support required to do the job, so had remained the case of delivery of the curriculum in the class.

Every document pinpoints the evils of monitoring, evaluation and examination system and dreams the bookish intrinsic worth of it but ground reality seems contrary to it and retailing that that there had happened a little or no change in the routine practice.

In the same way each document enumerates the physical facilities required and highlights the importance of all those in a quality education and some initial work happens in this regards but it brings no or little change in the routine teaching in educational instructions’.

### CONCLUSION

As for as vision concerned all the policy documents reiterate the same basic ideology, that is the culture values deeply rooted in Islam combined with freedom, honesty and integrity of Pakistan as a prime objective of

education “along with allied objective, such as development of science, technical, vocational, engineering, medicine, information technology, law, agriculture and rural areas related fields of knowledge and technologies, but failure is attributed to restrained financial recourses poor implementation and unenthusiastic attitude of field workforce and to uneven liaison between school community, always. Therefore, these areas need a research before preparing and launching a new policy in the field of education in Pakistan.

### **SUGGESTIONS**

The teacher is the pivot of any educational system around which the entire rigmarole of transfer of knowledge revolve. In order to get the maximum benefit from the knowledge and services of teachers, salaries and work conditions need to be attractive and accountable.

The education administration in the country should be decentralized gradually and be allowed to keep pace with the advancements the world over with psycho-social harmony without any further delay. This necessity has been recognized in the constitution of Pakistan but its stipulations have not been implemented fully since 1973. Every successive government promised to implement the constitutional stipulations in letter and spirit but fell far short of doing so with the result the confusion in the educational sector was confounded.

In the opinion of experts, one of the reasons for our poor academic standards has been the lack of emphasis in our educational policies on the importance of educational research.

Any plan for the re-orientation and re-organization of education in Pakistan should hinge on the objective of producing trained manpower, educated citizenry and competent leadership that is direly needed for efficiently managing the affairs of our country.

The nation, the youth, be developed and nourished on the value system where the law of Requital be the hub of life.

As both conservatives and progressive both were found in agreement on enlightened concept of education in which reasons and experience has a role of play for the progress and respect of the humanity, therefore it were not the objectives but the implementation which needs attention of the policy makers and implements in future to make Pakistan progress and progress.

### **REFERENCES**

Hayat, Sikandar, *Journal of Elementary Education*, Volume 1, No.7. (Lahore: University of Punjab, 2000).

Jonsson, Patrik, *The Daily Dawn*, (November 18, 2000).

Kemal, ‘Education Should Perpetuate Equality’, *News and Views*, Monthly Magazines, (Islamabad: Higher Education Commission, Pakistan, 2006).

Manzoor-ul-Haque, *Story of Pakistan: Ideological Perspective*. (London: Islamic Dawn Society, 2006).

Ministry of Education, *National Education Policy 1992*, (Islamabad: Government of Pakistan, 1992).

Ministry of Education, *National Educational Policy and Implementation Program*, (Islamabad, Government of Pakistan, 1979).

Ministry of Education, *National Educational Policy Iqra's 1998- 2010*, (Islamabad: Government of Pakistan, 1998).

Ministry of Education, *Report of the Commission of National Education* (Islamabad: Government of Pakistan, 1959).

Ministry of Education, *The Educational Policy 1972-1980*, (Islamabad: Government of Pakistan, 1972).

Ministry of Education, *The New Education Policy* (Islamabad: Government of Pakistan, 1970).

Ministry of Interior, Education Division, *Processing of the Pakistan Educational Conference held from 27.11.1947 to 01.12.1947*, (Karachi: Government of Pakistan, 1947).

Thomas J. Mc Nicholas, *Policy Making and Executive Action*. (New York: Mc Grew-Hill Book Company, 1977).