

**ASSESSING THE PERFORMANCE OF TEACHERS  
AT HIGHER EDUCATION LEVEL IN PAKISTAN:  
A PROPOSED PRACTICAL PARADIGM FOR ASSESSMENT**

*Ms Parveen Munshi*

**PREVIEW**

There is a general feeling that the quality of education has deteriorated rapidly and the present system has not responded to a large number of inputs introduced for raising the quality, which is directly related to the quality of teachers. Low competency level of teachers, un-marketable curricula and falling standards of students' intake are the main contributory factors in deteriorating quality of higher education. However, compounded with other factors is the non-qualified staff as a crucial factor. In the low priority of education, is the budget which is mostly consumed by salaries and other allowances. Thus a little is left for the items so essential for raising the quality of education.

The quest for quality has become a watchword the world over but this has not received sufficient attention it deserved in Pakistan. In other countries, there is an increasing emphasis on this aspect in the form of (a) establishment of the quality councils, (b) provision of quality assurance mechanisms, (c) performance indicators, (d) academic audit, (e) strategic planning and management, and (f) publication of ranking orders of the Colleges/Universities in teaching and research pursuits etc.

Quality of manpower is a prerequisite for advancement of knowledge, promotion of research and socioeconomic development of the country. The availability of such manpower is possible through (a) the awareness of the Critical Success Factors of Teacher's

performance, applicable to the teachers of particular stage, (b) identification of the performance gap, and (c) bridging up the same with the measures proved successful inter alia.

The National Education Policy 1998-2010 delineated that "The system of assessment of teachers performance shall be introduced for improvement of teaching learning process. Methods of self-assessment by teachers be introduced. The mechanism and assessment proforma shall be designed with the help of Vice-Chancellor's committee".<sup>1</sup>

It is in this connection that the concept of "*Critical Success Factors of Teacher's Performance*" is being elaborated along with listing of such factors derived from the related literature and experience.

#### CRITICAL SUCCESS FACTORS (CSF)

Quality and competence of personnel in a system is directly influenced by the provided academic environment, which in turn is directly influenced by the curriculum designed for this purpose. To **Russell**, proper curriculum for teacher should contain four components: (i) General Culture, (ii) Special Scholarship, (iii) Professional Knowledge, and (iv) Technical Skill.<sup>2</sup> Further **Cremin** (1978) elaborates these components: (i) **By General Culture**, he meant . . . the kind of preparation that would enable the students see the relationships among various fields of knowledge; (ii) **By Special Scholarship** he meant not only further academic study but the kind of reflective inquiry that would equip an aspiring teacher to select different sequences of material and adopt them to the needs of different students; (iii) **By Professional Knowledge** he implied . . . systematic inquiry into theory and practice of education, and (iv) **By Technical Skill** he implied . . .

expert ability in determining what to teach and by what methods, when and to whom.<sup>3</sup>

In this respect, Mir Muhammad Ali (1998) elaborates: "In the quest for improvement and development, educational staff development has undergone many changes since its emergence. The combined interest of educationists, economists, psychologists gave rise to a number of models of staff development. A comparatively simpler and more practical model is based on "*Critical Success Factors*" which include training of staff to attend to the demands of corporate reputation, social tune, faculty contribution, cost effectiveness, student relation, employee relations, public responsibility etc. Each factor is measured against a set of performance indicator".<sup>4</sup>

This corroborates the fact that roles, functions and activities of staff (teachers, supervisors and administrators) should serve as the basis to determine the specific area of staff development. This may include following aspects:

a. *Planning, Conducting Instruction*

- \* Understanding the objectives of institute
- \* Knowledge of the subject-matter
- \* Conduct of instruction.

b. *Managerial and Administrative Tasks*

- \* Knowledge of office procedures
- \* Knowledge of inter-personal skills (staff, students, parents)

c. *Counseling and Guidance*

- \* Skills related to handling student's problems
- \* Skills related to counseling the students

d. *Research and Development*

- \* Innovations in training and learning system
- \* Training in research.<sup>5</sup>

Applying this model the college/university teacher's critical success factors for performance may be described as under:

### **1. Conducting Training Need Analysis (TNA)**

From quality point of view, students come from heterogeneous sectors to understand their critical level to start with, their base line data may be properly understood.

### **2. Objectives of the Institution/Course/Subject**

Education is an objective-oriented activity. Thus a product teacher can not move without being clear about the general and specific objectives.

### **3. Knowledge of the Subject Matter**

At college/university level teaching emphasis shifts to comprehension of awareness and competence in skills. Naturally the college/university teacher has to reflect them with a high degree of awareness to satisfy mature students from all angles.

### **4. Conduct of Instructions/Practical**

To convey information effectively is the real work to be performed by teacher. Competency in this skill makes the efforts of teacher goal-oriented and participation of the students fruitful.

### **5. Knowledge of Office Procedures**

In order to work under a systematic procedure in an organized enterprise, the college teachers should be aware of the proceedings in use.

## **6. Knowledge of Interpersonal Skills**

Education under present scenario happens to be a teamwork, which without sound and healthy interpersonal relations cannot create healthy environment conducive for effective learning.

## **7. Skills Related to Handling of Student's Problems**

Due to individual differences the students encounter numerous problems which cannot be overlooked and it is the healthy influence of the teacher that can handle the problems and provide a relief to students to concentrate over their studies.

## **8. Skills Related to Counseling of Students**

In order to pay full attention over their studies, the students need a sympathetic awareness to guide them, help them, suggest them proper remedial approach to overcome their obstacles, thus college /university teacher in the image of a skilled counselor, is need of the time, particularly when there is no proper/formal counseling system in colleges.

## **9. Knowledge about the Innovations in Training Learning System**

Pakistani students retain the right to be rewarded with innovative discoveries in the specific field, which can be brought into the classroom through the teacher who is supposed to be skilled in the area.

## **10. Skills in Conducting Surveys, Action and Experimental Researches**

College education encircles the higher education of the system and Research is main component of the tertiary stage owing to problem already in the field and need to progress ahead in the area. Naturally to motivate, guide and supervise the students in research activities, the teacher at this stage is expected to be

skilled in awareness and conduct of research.

### **IDENTIFICATION OF SAMPLE ELEMENTS**

This model calls for the identification of specific indicators and their operational feasibility depicting the CSF of teachers to begin with:

#### **1. Conducting Training Need Analysis (TNA)**

##### ***Indicators***

- \* To assessment of how will the instructions/training match the learners needs
- \* Appraisal of the accuracy of instructions/training objectives
- \* Evaluation of how well a learner is able to correctly apply new knowledge
- \* Examination of how well a learner can transfer such knowledge.

##### ***Operational Feasibility***

- \* By applying pretest to the students
- \* By analysing the requirements after the completion of the course
- \* By examining the objectives critically
- \* By reviewing general application.

#### **2. Objectives of the Institutions/Course/Subject**

##### ***Indicators***

- \* Cognitive objectives, general/specific
- \* Affective objectives, general/specific
- \* Psychomotor objectives, general/specific.

##### ***Operational Feasibility***

- \* Referring curriculum prescribed by National Organization and listing them in details.

#### **3. Knowledge of the Subject-Matter**

##### ***Indicators***

- \* Command of the content of the course

- \* Awareness of the advancement in the field
- \* Awareness of the subject matter on advanced level.

### ***Operational Feasibility***

- \* Revision of the course
- \* Study of latest material on the field
- \* Study of periodicals/papers/latest issues
- \* Internet linkage with other universities/institutions.

## **4. Conduct of Instructions/Practical**

### ***Indicators***

- \* Ability to motivate students
- \* Ability to plan the subject-matter
- \* Ability to develop techniques for communication
- \* Conduct practical if necessary
- \* Evaluate objectively
- \* Construct tests, valid, reliable and objective
- \* Use printed and electronic devices for communication.

### ***Operational Feasibility***

- \* Attend suitable training programmes
- \* Participate refresher programmes/courses
- \* Consult senior colleagues/professionals
- \* Study related literature
- \* See video tapped programmes on the topics.

## **5. Knowledge of Office Procedures**

### ***Indicators***

- \* Awareness of the organizational rules/procedures
- \* Awareness of the disciplinary rules/regulations
- \* Maintenance of the record/registers and related entries

### ***Operational Feasibility***

- \* Study of the manuals/senior colleagues.

## **6. Knowledge of Interpersonal Skills**

### ***Indicators***

- \* Interpersonal relations with officials
- \* Interpersonal relations with colleagues
- \* Teacher student relations
- \* Teacher/parent/public relations
- \* Press-person healthy relation.

### ***Operational Feasibility***

- \* Co-curricular activities, public/social gatherings, contacts, Teachers common-room

## **7. Skills Related to Handling of Student Problems**

### ***Indicators***

- \* Understanding of human psychology
- \* Awareness about on-campus/off-campus environment
- \* Ability to explore the root cause of the student problem
- \* Self-control in emotional situation
- \* Gaining confidence of the students
- \* Exercising of healthy influence over colleagues/students

### ***Operational Feasibility***

- \* Study of adolescent and adult psychology
- \* Study of the guidance programme and its practical use
- \* Informal and friendly relations with colleagues/students
- \* Taking real interest in student problems and attempting to solve them under missionary spirit.

## **8. Skills Related to Counselling of Students**

### ***Indicators***

- \* Adequate knowledge of the psychology of the students he is required to teach
- \* Adequate knowledge of principles of guidance and counselling
- \* Skill in counselling activities

### ***Operational Feasibility***

- \* Studying Human Psychology with special reference to educational psychology
- \* Developing ability in the techniques of evaluation, guidance and counselling
- \* Being flexible and imaginative in interpretation of his role

## **9. Knowledge About the Innovations in Training Learning System**

### ***Indicators***

- \* Uptodate information about innovations in education, their practical application
- \* Use of the printed and electronic devices and thereby communication
- \* Standardized test construction and evaluation
- \* Statistical interpretation of data

### ***Operational Feasibility***

- \* Study of the latest information on educational innovation
- \* Practical use of the communication devices, their maintenance and handling
- \* Study of measurement, evaluation and statistics

## **10. Knowledge About Research**

### ***Indicators***

- \* Theoretical and practical awareness of research
- \* Preparation of tools of research
- \* Data collection and interpretation
- \* Use of computer and internet devices for research purpose
- \* Research report writing techniques

### ***Operational Feasibility***

- \* Study of research techniques and preparation of tools
- \* Data collection and interpretation
- \* Use of computer and internet and related technologies

#### **PERFORMANCE APPRAISAL INSTRUMENT APPLICATION (PAIA)**

Teacher performance assessment programmes affect curriculum decisions. Teachers/educators consequently revise curricula and prepare programmes on the basis of the assessment consequent during their formative and summative evaluations.

Scoring procedures based on the Performance Appraisal Instrument Application vary, for example Florida Performance Measurement System (FPMS) uses tallies of teaching behaviours and scoring procedure that in value aggregating of pints for effective behaviour and deduction for ineffective behaviour. A total score is based upon frequency and distributions of norms item scores on the effective and ineffective sides of instrument in contrast with the 1985 revision of **Georgia's Teacher Performance Assessment Instrument (TPAI)** which limits compensation in several ways. Observers scores discriptors are then aggregated to make indicators scores. These in turn are aggregated to make competency scores. Thus for each competence, there are several indicators, sub-scores, generated by each observer.

The Georgia and Florida state programmes have had májor impact on student-teaching and school district assessment programmes in their states and throughout U.S.A. Despite these major efforts, state agencies, colleges, universities and school districts, interested in the assessment of teaching, have yet to develop a consistent way of communicating what is being learned about evaluation system.

But here in Pakistan, inspite of the so-called formative and summative systems, there is a long way to go to establish a valid and reliable teacher performance appraisal system. Hence, as an example, this draft

instruments for teacher performance appraisal under the **Critical Success Factors (CSF)** model is presented which is open for criticism and pilot study.

**EXAMPLE OF A TEACHER PERFORMANCE APPRAISAL INSTRUMENT FOR COLLEGE/UNIVERSITY TEACHERS INCORPORATING CRITICAL SUCCESS FACTOR APPROACH**

**Domain 'A' Planning and Conducting Instructions**

***Criterion 1. Conducting Training Need Analysis (TNA)***

- Indicators
- a) Assesses the students ability
  - b) Examines accuracy of instructions
  - c) Assesses capability to grasp knowledge
  - d) Assesses ability to transfer knowledge

***Criterion 2. Awareness about the objectives of the institutions/course subject***

- Indicators
- a) Awareness about the general and specific cognitive objectives
  - b) Awareness about the general and specific affective objectives
  - c) Awareness about the general and specific psychomotor objectives

***Criterion 3. Knowledge of the Subject-matter***

- Indicators
- a) Command on the content of the course
  - b) Awareness of the advancement in the field
  - c) Awareness of the subject-matter on advance level

***Criterion 4. Conduct of Instructions/Practical***

- Indicators
- a) Ability to motivate students
  - b) Ability to plan the subject-matter for instructions
  - c) Ability to develop techniques for communication
  - d) Conduct practical efficiently
  - e) Evaluate objectively
  - f) Construct valid, reliable and objective tests

- g) Use printed and electronic devices for communications

## **Domain 'B' Management and Administrative Tasks**

### ***Criterion 5. Knowledge of the Office Procedures***

- Indicators
- a) Awareness of the organizational rules/procedures
  - b) Awareness of the disciplinary rules/regulations
  - c) Maintenance of the record/registers and related entries

### ***Criterion 6. Knowledge of Interpersonal Skills***

- Indicators
- a) Demonstrates interpersonal relations with colleagues
  - b) Demonstrates healthy relations with officials
  - c) Proves good teacher student relations
  - d) Demonstrates good teacher parent/public relation
  - e) Proves good fame in the press
  - f) Demonstrates professionals ethical rules

## **Domain 'C' Counselling and Guidance**

### ***Criterion 7. Skills related to handling of students' problems***

- Indicators
- a) Understands human psychology
  - b) Awareness about in-campus environment
  - c) Awareness about off-campus environment
  - d) Ability to explore the root cause of student problems
  - e) Self-control in emotional situations
  - f) Gains confidence of the students
  - g) Exercises healthy influence over colleagues
  - h) Exercises healthy influence over students

### ***Criterion 8. Skills related to counselling of students***

- Indicators
- a) Possesses adequate knowledge of psychology of the students the teachers is required to teach
  - b) Possesses adequate knowledge of principles of

- guidance and counselling  
c) Skilled in counselling activities

## **Domain 'D' Research and Development**

### ***Criterion 9. Knowledge about the innovations in training learning system***

- Indicators
- a) Uptodate information about innovations
  - b) Use of printed and electronic devices
  - c) Standardized test construction and evaluation
  - d) Statistical interpretation of data

### ***Criterion 10. Knowledge about Research***

- Indicators
- a) Theoretical and practical awareness of research
  - b) Preparation of tools of research
  - c) Data collection and interpretation
  - d) Use of computer and internet for research.

The mode of assessment can be combined, involving observer most probably the principal or some other authorized person, for the purpose of interviewing the teacher under observation, studying the evidences of teachers performance what so ever possible, mentioning in the instrument indicating the frequencies and remarking the observations against the indicator, as A, B, C, D and E, where A is for excellent, B is for good, C is for average, D is for below average, and E is for poor. The instrument given helps to illustrate the procedure.

**INSTRUMENT (A SAMPLE)**

Statement	1ST OBSERVATION			2ND OBSERVATION			3RD OBSERVATION			4TH OBSERVATION		
	Date	Method	Rank	Date	Method	Rank	Date	Method	Rank	Date	Method	Rank
Ability to Motivate Students.	5.1.98	Obs	C	16.2.98	Obs	B	27.3.98	Obs	D	3.4.98	Obs	A
Command on the content of the course.	14.1.98	Obs	B	22.2.98	Obs	B	4.4.98	Obs	A	10.4.98	Obs	A
Maintenance of the record registers and related entries.	17.1.98	Obs	D	18.2.98	Obs	C	24.3.98	Obs	B	15.4.98	Obs	A
Teacher/ Parent/ Public relations.	22.1.98	Obs	B	24.2.98	Obs	B	18.3.98	Obs	A	25.4.98	Obs	A
Standardized test construction and evaluation	2.1.98	Obs	C	28.2.98	Obs	B	13.3.98	Obs	A	25.4.98	Obs	A

## CONCLUSION

Low competency level of teachers is considered the most crucial among the factors identified as deteriorating the quality of higher education. National Education Policy 1998-2010 has emphasized the need of evolving a mechanism of assessment of teachers' performance. It is in this context that the concept of **Critical Success Factors** is being elaborated. This involves four aspects: (i) Quality of teaching outcomes for discovering what happens to students as a result of teachers work; (ii) Faculty membership for the degree to which an individual teacher carries his fair share of the Faculty load; (iii) Community activities to gauge the extent to which they take an active part in community; and (iv) Contributions to the profession to improve itself through its own activities. This model calls for the identification of specific indicators and their operational feasibility.

Performance Appraisal Instrument has been applied in various ways in the States abroad. In this direction, the Georgia and Florida State programmes have had major impact throughout the States. However, a consistent way of communicating what is being learned about evaluation system, has yet to be developed.

But in Pakistan, it appears there is still a long way to establish a valid and reliable Teacher Performance Appraisal System. This draft instrument is such an example for the higher education level, based on Critical Success Factors; and suggests that, if the teachers are convinced that Cooperative Evaluation is the best answer to the problem, they should (i) agree on what to evaluate; (ii) decide how and by whom the evaluation be made; (iii) arrange and process the data; and (iv) make recommendations on the basis of the results. That will pave way for assessing higher education paradigms

to enter the 21st century with an appreciable degree of achievement in the comity of nations.

#### REFERENCES

1. Government of Pakistan (1998) "*National Education Policy 1998-2010*", Ministry of Education, Islamabad, p.79.
2. Sharon Feiman-Nemser, "*Teacher Preparation: Structural and Conceptual Alternatives*", in W.Robert Houston, (Editor), "*Hand Book of Research on Teacher Education*", Macmillan Company, U.S.A., 1990, p.45.
3. Cremin, L. (1978), "*The Education of Educating Profession*", (the 19th Charles W.Hunt-lecture) Chicago: American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education, pp.10-11.
4. Mir Muhammad Ali, "*Staff Development*" in "*Issues in Teacher Education*", Basic Reference Material to Ph.D. Education, Hamdard University, Karachi, 1998, p.66.
5. Ibid., p.63.