
**INFUSING MORAL VALUES AMONG OUR YOUTH:
ANALYSIS OF ENGLISH LANGUAGE TEXTBOOKS TAUGHT
AT COLLEGE LEVEL IN BALUCHISTAN PAKISTAN**

Sahira Bano

Assistant Professor, Govt. Girls Degree College Khuzdar, Baluchistan

Email: sahirabano79@gmail.com

Abdullah Laghari

*Lecturer, Department of English, Quaid-e-Awam University of Engineering,
Science & Technology, Nawabshah*

Email: abdullahlaghari612@gmail.com

Dr. Inayatullah Kakepoto

*Professor, Department of English, Quaid-e-Awam University of Engineering,
Science & Technology, Nawabshah*

Email: kinayat@quest.edu.pk

ABSTRACT

A rich curriculum contributes towards producing better humans. The study targets assessing moral values embedded in English textbooks HSC-I&II taught to college students of Baluchistan as recommended by Baluchistan board. Moral values tend to be developed through curriculum taught to students at school, college and university for sake of character-building. English textbooks HSC-I&II content was inspected systematically from stand point of infusing moral values among novice learners. At first, certain moral values were explored and enlisted from existing literature and then textbook content was critically analyzed using content analysis tactic method. Different moral values found in the textbooks under scrutiny were categorized and enlisted. The research findings showed content of HSC-II English language textbook contained certain moral values-related content adequately whereas; HSC-I textbook lacked moral values exhibition. It is fact college students pursue good impression from textbooks because their minds are still raw at this stage of life. Henceforth, this study recommends addition of additional Islamic and ethical values in English language textbooks taught to college students at intermediate level for grooming their personalities and character building which pay back in numerous ways in personal and professional life of these students.

Keywords: Building, ESL students English language textbooks, College level, Moral values, Character, Curriculum

INTRODUCTION

Textbooks are source of teaching and learning process (Putra & Lukmana, 2017), they tend to be means of inculcating specific ethics

and ideals in learners (Widodo, 2018; Setyono & Widodo, 2019) minds. Integrating moral values in youth and building their character is global issue in this modern age of globalization. Pakistan is no exception to it. Pakistan is an Islamic Republic state and its foundation was laid on firm principles of Islam and strong morality and character building of its citizens. Morality is a set of standards that are accepted and agreed mutually in any society (Ahmad, 2018). Widodo et al., (2018) state morality may vary in different social contexts and from one society to another. These values and norms shape individuals' ideology, perceptions, and conduct (Widodo, 2018). However; these norms are molded and moderated through people interactions (Gu, 2016) from time to time. Islam preaches moral conduct and advises its believers to follow strictly in all means. Further; it clearly differentiates between the right and wrong, good and bad and provides comprehensive guidelines to follow. Halstead (2007) describes some important moral values like covenant keeping, honesty, humility, respect for others, tolerance, good manners, kindness, good manners, brotherhood and avoiding backbiting.

A serious problem faced by today's world is deterioration of ethical ideals (George & Uyanga, 2014) and morals. Societies are rampant with immoral activities including narrow-mindedness, dishonesty, disrespect, contempt, deceit, fraudulence, injustice, and more i.e., illegitimate acts (George & Uyanga, 2014; Demirel, et al, 2016; Webber, 2017). The destruction of morality is main cause of deteriorating situation in societies which gives birth to numerous evils and the society of Pakistan exhibits a very poor scenario in this dimension currently. Teaching moral values to young students is indispensable in order to prepare them better humans for the society and the state. Numerous authors agree education can be paramount source of teaching morality to young students (Akram et al., 2021; Tamam, 2017; Muzaffar & Javaid, 2018), because the main purpose of education is to train students to reform their moral conduct and behaviour. Noteworthy to mention; curriculum is a significant tool of education (Alvi, Khanam & Kalsoom, 2020) to be used for teaching morality to students. Hence; inculcating moral values among young children through curriculum is major objective of any world educational system (Lovat, 2017). In Pakistan, ESL students' language skills are polished by teaching English as a second language (ESL) and

character building is shaped by implanting ethical norms and moral values in them. Religious and civic education is taught explicitly through Islamic studies/Islamiat/Deniati/Ethics and few other subjects like English, Pakistan studies and social studies as compulsory subjects. More, it is attempted to inject these moral values and ideologies in youth implicitly through content of these subjects.

Language education provides an opportunity to teachers imparting moral values and ideologies among students (Thongrin, 2012). Language teaching can be transporter of transferring ethical values and norms. Language textbooks can be agents of supplying such values and norms to students and these can be supplements for teachers (Orton, 2010). Broadly speaking, teachers and students are main stakeholders of language textbooks and they may be exposed to specific ideologies (Feng, 2017) through textbooks about which are ignorant (Widodo, 2018) approves research is evident that language textbooks are demonstration of concealed philosophies which could infuse specific values and ethical norms among teachers and taught. However, some experts suggest teachings of moral values should be explicitly included in all subjects including language teaching (Mambu, 2015).

Researchers like (Johnston, 2003; Akbari, & Tajik, 2012; Widodo et al., 2018) promote idea of integrating morality into language classrooms. Shaaban (2005) claims that a language teacher finds suitable place to teach moral values in an ESL/EFL classroom. Widodo et al., (2018) recommends language textbooks be used as vital agents of imparting moral values through different class activities. There are ample studies that focus on evaluation of English language textbooks from different perspectives analyzing English textbooks from view point of morality which is scarcely seen in Pakistan. So, present study is a humble effort from researchers to fill this gap, and the study scrutinizes inclusion of moral values in the content of English language textbooks HSC- I & II as recommended by Baluchistan Board.

RESEARCH QUESTIONS

1. How far the content of English language textbook does used for HSC I&II (Baluchistan Board) infuse moral values and ethical norms in young students?

2. Does the content given in English language textbooks HSC- I & II (Baluchistan Board) have sufficient moral values and ethical norms for young students?

RESEARCH OBJECTIVES

1. To examine the content of English language textbook used for HSC - I & II (Baluchistan Board) for moral values and ethical norms.
2. To assess if the content has sufficient moral values and ethical norms given in English language textbooks HSC - I & II (Baluchistan Board).

LITERATURE REVIEW

Pakistan is an Islamic state and as per 1973 constitution and it follows Islamic principles. All Muslims are expected to lead lives as social members of society according to teachings of Holy Quran and Sunnah (Uzmi & Nakhoda 2015). Islam provides complete code of life to all Muslims of the world to be observed strictly in every profession of life. Islam teaches to achieve high moral values (Saulat 2014). Scholarly figures observed high moral values in personal and professional life and set the best examples for youth. Morality is a system of determining the difference between the right and wrong, which finally leads to ethical path (Rabia Siddiqui & Zehra Habib, 2021). Morality is something related to good or bad (Sukma et al., 2021). Morality is one of the basic principles of Islam and it guides people towards well-being of any society morally and professionally. Societies are rampant with immoral acts i.e., narrow-mindedness, dishonesty, disrespect, contempt, deceitfulness, fraudulence, and injustice (George & Uyanga, 2014; Demirel, et al., 2016; Webber, 2017). Morality fixes human personality and controls conduct (Muzaffar, Javaid, & Sohail, 2017). All human societies need to adopt morality as fundamental principle of life else; it would turn into a barbarian society. Islam emphasizes upon moral values i.e., humbleness, tolerance, justice, kindness, respect for people, and brotherhood (Shah, Raza, & Irfan, 2021). It is a miracle of moral values that determines what is accepted, unaccepted and forbidden. People upholding moral values practice honesty, kindness, forgiveness, justice and tolerance (Kaur, 2015). Human societies

become civilized because of moral values and maintain healthy relations with families and friends. There is extensive list of moral values but few include honesty, fairness, truthfulness, frankness, humbleness, kindness, cooperation, sympathy, patience, and tolerance, and observance of these values cultivate one's happiness and comfort (Sari, 2013). The term 'moral' is linked with values in language curriculum (Xiong, 2012) and morality is part of national curricula taught at all levels of learning (Doan, 2005). Lovat (2017) said inclusion of ethical values among youth through curriculum is basic purpose of education. Morality teachings shape character building of young students which pay towards development of a healthy society which pays back prosperity to people. It teaches values like honesty, fairness, respect, and social responsibility (Shaaban, 2005).

Siddiqui Rabia et al., (2021) studied moral education and found role of poor curricula towards low moral education and contribution towards students' morality. Feng D. William (2019) studied infusing moral education into English language teaching and explored social values change disposition of strong lifestyle through interpersonal domain i.e., politeness and respect. Sulistiyo Urip et al., (2020) researched moral content in English textbooks and found value of helping others, politeness and caring as dominant factors. Kusramadhani Sherina et al., (2022) surveyed moral values in English textbooks and found social awareness, curiosity, and responsibility in textbooks. Tampubolon Sahlan et al., (2022) studied moral values in English ELT textbook and explored respect for others, and friendliness as moral attributes. Khoirunnisa Filzah et al., (2021) studied moral education in ELT and found tolerance, polite behaviour, care for peers and respect for others. Wang Jing (2022) investigated moral values in English course books and concluded books contained moral and cultural values. Rahmadona Mutia et al., (2022) studied moral values in a textbook. Politeness, religion and solidarity were marked as moral values. Setiawan Iwan et al., (2017) study found kindness and fairness as the least moral values in English textbooks. Sri Imelwaty et al., (2022) study exposed fairness, cooperation, loyalty, authority, and sanctity as moral values. Rana Majid et al., (2021) study examined moral development between private school and madrassah students and found private school students were morally better developed than Madrassah students. Waqar Sajid et al., (2021) explored human values

through school curriculum and concluded human values associated with tolerance and equality are adequately present but students lack honesty and patience. Herrera (2019) inspected moral values and behaviour in ESOL newcomer classrooms and suggested moral values and behaviour need to be learned both at home and school. Mahrudin et al., (2023) studied moral values in an EFL textbook and explored textbook containing behaviour and sense of responsibility as moral values. Khan Mamona et al., (2022) studied ideology in an English textbook and found helping the poor, and elderly with respect, punctuality, honesty, and cleanliness as ideologies present in English textbook. Looking at importance of moral values in education researchers endeavoured to explore moral values prevalent in English language textbooks taught to college students of Baluchistan in order to make this province peaceful and prosperous like other provinces of Pakistan.

RESEARCH METHOD

Qualitative research mode was employed and content of HSC-I & II textbooks was used to explore ethical norms and moral values included in these textbooks. First, major moral values were enlisted from available literature later textbook chapters were critically observed and analyzed drawing outcomes. Finally, all observed values were marked and presented in a tabular form for drawing further conclusions and explanations.

Material: Textbooks under this study were English language textbooks HSC-I & II taught in public and private colleges of Baluchistan, Pakistan. The rationale for selection of these textbooks was based the philosophy of exploring how these books induct moral values among collegiate students. HSC-I textbook is taught as single textbook and contains ten (10) chapters, five poems and one play. This is compulsory textbook taught to first-year students. All ten (10) chapters were assessed and evaluated. HSC-II textbook is taught as single textbook, it comprises of eleven (11) chapters, five poems and one play. It is taught to intermediate part-II students. All chapters of the textbook were assessed and evaluated to find out moral values available in these textbooks.

RESEARCH FINDINGS

A thorough review of existing literature was led for enlisting moral values included in textbooks. The following moral and ethical values were listed. Later, textbook content under examination was assessed in light of selected values and results were drawn accordingly.

TABLE-1
LIST OF MORAL VALUES FOUND IN LITERATURE REVIEW

Moral Values of an Individual and Society				
Trust in Allah Uzmi & Nakhoda (2015)	Happiness Sulistiyo (2020)	Discipline Sulistiyo (2020)	Brotherhood Halstead (2007), Shah et al., (2015).	Care for family Saulat (2014)
Piousness Saulat (2014)	Generosity Sulistiyo (2020)	Fairness Shaaban (2005)	Care for others Shaaban (2005).	Equality Khan (2015), Feng (2017)
Taqwa Soomro & Tanweer (2017)	Justice Kaur (2015), Shah et al., (2021)	Selflessness Sulistiyo (2020)	Sympathy Sulistiyo (2020)	Politeness Khan (2015)
Acting upon Teachings of Prophet (PBUH) Khalid Ahmed (2008)	Cooperation Sulistiyo (2020)	Love for Humanity Saulat (2014)	Appreciation Sulistiyo (2020)	Honesty Halstead (2007), Kaur (2015), Shaaban (2005).
Good manners Halstead (2007)	Diligence Liu (2005). Interdependence Feng (2017)	Efficiency Sulistiyo (2020)	Self-esteem Feng (2017)	Truthfulness Tahir et al., (2022)
Avoid Backbiting Halstead (2007)	Modesty Liu (2005)	Covenant keeping Halstead (2007)	Respect for authority Liu (2005)	Love Khan (2015)

Tolerance Liu (2005), Halstead (2007), Shah et al., (2021), Kaur (2015)	Gratitude Sulistiyo (2020)	Humility Halstead (2007), Kaur (2015), Shah et al., (2021)	Forgiveness Kaur (2015)	Respect Women Shaukat (2012)
Respect Khan (2015), Shah et al., (2021), Halstead (2007)	Responsibility Kemendiknas , (2011)	Kindness Hlstead (2007), Kaur (2015), Shah et al., (2021)	Fairness Shaaban (2005)	Perseverance Feng (2017)

Table indicates moral values with titles found from the existing literature review. A careful analysis of textbook content revealed these themes and sub-themes related to moral values. Teaching chapters with these themes and sub-themes assisted teachers in teaching various norms and values to students in classrooms. The young students of Baluchistan got an invisible impression of such values in mind while studying English as compulsory subject.

TABLE-2
CONTENT ANALYSIS OF TEXTBOOK HSC-I GRADE XI FOR MORAL VALUES

Themes related to Moral Values	Page	Themes related to Moral Values	Page
Love children	11	Social responsibility	105
Kindness	11	Courage	137, 106
affection	21	Following rules	41
discipline	21, 39	Discipline	49
Environmental responsibility	49	Preventing pollution	51
Care for family	136	Love for one's family	69, 136

In HSC-I textbook, the above-mentioned values were observed which further were categorized as follows. The first type of value was family-based including themes of family care, kindness, affection and love for children. Second value was social and environmental responsibilities such as crisis management, discipline, preventing pollution and following rules etc. HSC-I, textbook has chapters mostly

based on information about library use, global warming, literary writings, managing earthquakes and the vanished city of the world. Undoubtedly, textbooks are somehow effective in civic sense and social responsibilities for young students but they still need more content for inclusion of moral values.

TABLE-3
CONTENT ANALYSIS OF TEXTBOOK HSC II GRADE XII
FOR MORAL VALUES

Themes related to Moral Values	Page	Themes related to Moral values	Page
Mutual responsibility	1	Devotion	26
Women Rights	1, 196	Patriotism	26, 152
Kindness	1, 2	Loyalty	26
Justice	1, 153, 155	Sympathy	26
Forgiveness	2	Love	26
Honesty	2	Desirous of peace	27, 154
Optimism	52	Care for family	40
Continue Struggle	53, 155	Diligence	51,155
Happiness, Joy	53	Social responsibilities	117
Courage, Devotion, Perseverance	59,	Brotherhood	26, 155
Freedom	155, 156	Cooperation	26
Drug prevention	114	Care for others' feelings	41

In HSC-II textbook themes and sub themes of a wide range of moral values extending from personal values to social values were observed. Personal values included devotion, loyalty, love, sympathy, diligence, kindness, honesty, happiness, joy and courage. Social values were observed like patriotism, brotherhood, desire for peace, cooperation, care for others and justice. There are eleven chapters in HSC-II textbook and almost in all chapters, some themes or sub-themes related to morality were observed. It surfaced HSC- II English textbook contains sufficient moral values. Further, it was observed HSC-II English textbook has more themes and sub-themes about

moral values and ethical norms compared to HSC-I textbook. Summing up, HSC-II textbook exhibits sufficient morality-based content whereas; HSC-I textbook does not include much morality content taught to young collegiate students. There are ten chapters in HSC-I textbook and content is rather more related to informative and literary topics. Thus, based on drawn results it is concluded HSC-I English textbook does not comprise sufficient values in its content. Therefore, it is recommended more morality-related themes be incorporated through stories or different chapters in HSC-I English textbook taught to college students as recommended by Baluchistan Board.

DISCUSSION

Though under discussion textbooks are language textbooks, but careful scrutiny stipulates that definite ethical values are included in contents of these textbooks that connect these books to culture of Pakistan as an Islamic state that need to follow certain moral values in all professions of life. The most dominated values emerged are justice, courage, women rights, continuous struggle, freedom, patriotism, desire of peace, and brotherhood. These values are diverse from findings of other studies i.e. Imelwaty et al., (2022), Widodo (2018), Puspitasari et al., (2021), Pratiwi et al., (2023), and Naidu & Jamil (2018). The discrepancies of appearance of ethical values in other textbooks exhibit that different authors and publishers lay stress on certain values that college or school students inculcate according to their age. Several other moral values were not figured out within the present textbooks, but these were found by some researchers in textbooks analyzed. For example, values of religiosity (prayer, fasting, zakat and alms) occur mostly in Johnson (2021), respect, kindness and tolerance Prasetyo (2022). However, many religious values within the textbooks are not observed in this current study.

CONCLUSION

English Language textbooks need to contain important moral values which infuse morality and sagacity among young students of Pakistan. This study was conducted to analyze content of HSC-I & II English language textbooks prescribed by Baluchistan Board to examine moral values prevailing in designated textbooks. English

language textbooks analysis showed textbooks under examination contain numerous moral values as taught to young students while teaching English language course books. Moral values about personal traits like honesty, truthfulness, kindness, loyalty, family care, and social and global responsibilities were almost found. Moral and ethical values are sufficiently prevalent in HSC-II textbook however; inclusion of more value-related topics in HSC-I is required for character building of college students at an early stage of life. Generally, the content of textbooks may be supportive of character-building and shaping students' personalities at college level. However; it depends on teachers' way of teaching how they teach this content in classrooms. Besides, in HSC-I & II textbooks' examples of great personalities for instance Holy Prophet Hazrat Mohammad (PBUH) the last prophet of Muslims, Quid-e-Azam Mohammad Ali Jinnah the founder of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, Abou Bin Adhem, Abraham Lincoln and many more be included as role models for young students to prepare them better citizens who can sufficiently contribute in the development of the nation. Their golden and motivational quotes tend to be included in textbooks to inspire young students to excel in their personal and professional lives. HSC-I textbook contains content of informative, literary and history-related domains. Three short stories contain good reading material and the rest are informative chapters for HSC-I students. This study concludes that given content in HSC-II English textbook taught to collegiate students in Baluchistan contains sufficient moral values. However, HSC-I textbook needs revision and refinement and more chapters and stories related to moral teachings may be included. Further, the same textbooks be studied from a critical discourse analysis perspective for more details to unveil hidden ideologies and messages conveyed to young students. The results of the study show that inculcating moral values whether they may be religious, personal, social, cultural or civil values are effective in instilling moral teachings of youth.

REFERENCES

- Ahmad, M. J. (2018). Incorporation of Social and Moral Values through Secondary School Curriculum: A Content Analysis (Doctoral dissertation).

- Akbari, R., & Tajik, L. (2012). Second-language teachers' moral knowledge base: A comparison between experienced and less experienced, male and female practitioners. *Journal of Moral Education*, 41(1), 39-59.
- Akram, H., Al-Adwan, A. S., Aslam, S., & Khan, M. I. (2021). Pedagogical practices and challenges in cultivating moral values: A qualitative study of primary school teachers in Pakistan. *Education 3- 13*, 1-13.
- Alvi, S. T., Khanam, A., & Kalsoom, T. (2020). Document Analysis of Secondary School Curriculum Regarding Ethical and Moral Education in Punjab. *Global Regional Review*, 5(1), 191-206.
- Baig, S., Javed, F., Siddiquah, A., & Khanam, A. (2021). A content analysis of English textbook of Punjab Textbook Board of grade 8 in Pakistan. *SAGE Open*, 11(2), 21582440211023159.
- Demirel, M., Özmat, D., & Elgün, I. Ö. (2016). Primary School Teachers' Perceptions about Character Education. *Educational Research and Reviews*, 11(17), 1622-1633.
- Doan, H. D. (2005). Moral education or political education in the Vietnamese educational system? *Journal of Moral Education*, 34 (4), 451- 463.
- Feng, D. W. (2019). Infusing moral education into English language teaching: an ontogenetic analysis of social values in EFL textbooks in Hong Kong. *Discourse: Studies in the Cultural Politics of Education*, 40 (4), 458-473.
- George, I. N., & Uyanga, U. D. (2014). Youth and moral values in a changing society. *IOSR Journal of humanities and social science*, 19 (6), 40-44.
- Gu, X. (2016). Evaluation in US and Japanese history textbooks. *Text & Talk*, 36, 221-243.
- Halstead, J. M. (2007). Islamic values: a distinctive framework for moral education? *Journal of Moral Education*, 36 (3), 283-296.
- Herrera L. J. P. (2019). How to Behave and Why: Exploring moral values and behaviour in the ESOL newcomer classroom. *TESOL Quarterly*, 53 (4), 1033-1059.
- Irfan, H. (2021). Insightful perspectives about effective implementation of ESL single national curriculum (SNC) in Pakistani schools. *Pakistan Social Sciences Review*, 5 (1) 975-986.
- Johnston, B. (2003). Values in English language teaching. Lawrence Erlbaum.
- Kaur, S. (2015). Moral values in education. *IOSR Journal of Humanities and Social Science*, 20 (3), 21- 26.
- Khokhar, A. J. (2021). Islamic values in language textbooks published by the State Textbook Authorities in Pakistan. *The Journal of Religious Studies of the University of Chitral (UOCHJRS)*, 4(2), 120-141.
- Khalidy, A. (2008). The nature of Islamic morals and the morals of Women's prophets. https://www.academia.edu/9557014/the_nature_of_islamic_moral_and_the_moral_of_Prophet
- Khan, M. (2015). Women's rights in Islam's true picture. <http://www.bookhut.net/women-rightsin-islam-status-role>

- Khan, M. Y., & Ali, A. (2022). Exploring Ideologies in Primary English Textbook (SNC-2020): A Critical Discourse Analysis. *Perennial Journal of History*, 3(1), 35-48.
- Khoirunnisa Filzah, Suryaman M., Yanto S. E. (2021). Moral education in ELT: A critical discourse analysis of tolerance values represented in Indonesian EFL Textbook, 9(2), 88-100.
- Kusramadhani S., Nirwanto R., Widiastuty H. (2022). Moral values in English Textbook: "When English rings a bell". *PROJECT (Professional Journal of English Education)* 5 (2), 344-353.
- Lestariyana, R. P. D., & Widodo, H. P. (2018). Engaging young learners of English with digital stories: Learning to mean. *Indonesian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 8(2) 489-495.
- Liu, Y. (2005). Discourse, cultural knowledge and ideology: A critical analysis of Chinese language textbooks. *Pedagogy, Culture and Society*, 13 (2), 233-264.
- Lovat, T. (2017). Values education as good practice pedagogy: Evidence from Australian Empirical research. *Journal of Moral Education*, 46 (1), 88-96.
- Mambu, J. E. (2015). Challenges in assessing character education in ELT: Implications from a case study in a Christian university. *TEFLIN Journal*, 26 (2), 183-208.
- Mahrudin, M.A. S., Hidayat, D. N., Husna, N., & Alek. A. (2023). Critical Discourse Analysis of Moral Values in EFL Textbook for Senior High School. *Al-Lisan: Jurnal Bahasa (e-Journal)*, 8 (1), 45-61.
- Muzaffar, M., Javaid, M. A., & Sohail, F. (2017). Role of Pakistan Studies in Promoting Political Awareness at Secondary Level in Pakistan, *Bulletin of Education and Research*, 39 (3), 57-74.
- Orton, J. (2010). Culture and English materials. In H. P. Widodo & L. Savova (Eds.), *The Lincom guide to ELT materials design and development: Theory and practice* (pp.215-228). Lincom Europa.
- Pratiwi, Y., Andajani, K., Suyitno, I., Ismail, A., & Prastio, B. (2023). Representing and Implementing Moral Values to Foreign Students in Indonesian Textbooks for Learners Other than Indonesians. *International Journal of language Education*, 7(1), 58-76.
- Rahmadona Mutia, Yelliza, Siska (2022). Moral Values on the Songs in Student's Textbook When English Rings a Bell for 7th Grade Junior High School. *Halaman*, 6 (1), 3043-3048.
- Rana A. M. Khan, Rana N. A., Shafiq R. (2021). A comparative study of moral development of students from private schools and madrassahs. *Elementary Education Online*, 20 (5), 3628-3634.
- Sari, N. (2013). The importance of teaching moral values to the students. *Journal of English and Education*, 1(1), 154-162.
- Saulat. (2014). Morality and ethics in Islam. <http://www.whyislam.org/social-values-in-islam/morality-ethics-in-islam/> Accessed 24th August, 2023.

- Shah, H. M., Raza, M., & Irfan, M. (2021). Morality in Islam and Culture of Moral Education in Pakistan-A Comparative Analysis. *Elementary Education Online*, 20 (5), 4505-4505.
- Shaaban, K. (2005). A proposed framework for incorporating moral education into the ESL/EFL classroom. *Language, Culture and Curriculum*, 18 (2), 201-217.
- Shaukat, Q. (2012). The equality of education for men and women in Islam. <https://saypeople.com/2012/05/22/the-equality-of-education-for-men-and-women-in-islam/> Accessed on 24th August, 2023.
- Setiawan, I., Fahriany. (2017). Moral Values in Narrative Texts of English Textbooks for Senior High School Students Published by the Ministry of Education and Culture. *IJEE Indonesian Journal of English Education*, 4 (2), 130-143.
- Siddiqui, R., & Habib, Z. (2021). Moral education at primary level in selected private schools of Karachi: Role of teachers and parents. *Pakistan Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences*, 9 (2), 59-73.
- Soomro, M. H., & Tanveer, S. H. (2017). Ethics and education in Pakistan: Principles, policies and practice. *Children and Sustainable Development: Ecological Education in a Globalized World*, 385-396.
- Sri Imelwaty, Fahmi G., St Kuraedah, Wiwik M., Dian E. C., Wardhana & S., B. (2022). Moral values in Indonesian primary school thematic textbooks: the marrying of language appraisal and moral foundation theories, *Education*, 3 (13), 1-13.
- Tampubolon Sahlan, Sidabutar Usman (2022). An Integration of Moral Values on the English Text Book of Vocational High School. A Case Study of Critical Discourse Analysis. *Edukatif: Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan*, 4(6), 8040-8051.
- Sukma, D. W., Yanto, E. S., & Kusrin (2021). Representation of moral values in one ELT textbook for senior high school students: critical discourse analysis. *PROJECT (Professional Journal of English Education)*, 4(6), 1037-1049.
- Sulistiyo, U., Haryanto, E., Widodo, H. P., & Elyas, T. (2019). The portrait of primary school English in Indonesia: Policy recommendations. *Education* 3 (13), 47, 1-15.
- Sulistiyo, U., Supiani, Kailani, A., & Lestariyana, R. P. D. (2020). Infusing moral content into primary school English textbooks: A critical discourse analysis. *Indonesian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 10 (1), 251-260.
- Tahir, H., & Zia, M. A. M. (2022). Exploring the level of moral values included in Islamiat's single National Curriculum at the Primary Level.
- Thongrin, S. (2012). EFL writing instruction. In A. Wiriayajitra (Ed.), *looking back, looking forward: English instruction* (pp.139-177).

- Uzmi, Z., & Nakhoda, S. (2015). The constitution of Pakistan. <https://www.pakistani.org/pakistan/constitution/preamble.html> [Accessed on 24th August, 2023].
- Waqar Sajid, Zarnab Ahmed, Sania Jabeen (2021). Promoting human values through high school curriculum: A study into discourse features of Pakistani ELT Textbooks. *Multicultural Education*, 7(4), 416-429.
- Widodo, H. P. (2018). A critical micro-semiotic analysis of values depicted in the Indonesian Ministry of National Education-endorsed secondary school English textbook. In H. P.
- Widodo et al. (eds.), *Situating moral and cultural values in ELT materials: The Southeast Asian context* (pp. 131-152). Springer International Publishing AG.
- Wang Jing (2022). Exploring moral values in English course books for university students in China. *LLT Journal: A Journal on Language and Language Learning*, 25(2) 434-446.
- Widodo, H. P., Perfecto, M. R. G., Canh, L. V., & Buripakdi, A. (Eds.). (2018). *Situating moral and cultural values in ELT materials: The Southeast Asian context*. Springer International Publishing AG.
- Xiong, T., & Qian, Y. (2012). Ideologies of English in a Chinese high school EFL textbook: A critical discourse analysis. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education*. 32(1), 75-92.
-