
**EXPLORING THE LIMITS OF LABOUR LAWS FOCUSING ON WOMEN
DOMESTIC WORKERS & GENDER EMPOWERMENT IN PAKISTAN**

Dr. Najma Gopang

Assistant professor, Institute of Gender Studies, University of Sindh, Jamshoro

Email: najma.gopang@usindh.edu.pk.

Dr. Misbah Bibi Qureshi

Professor of Gender Studies & Pro Vice Chancellor, Thatta Campus,

University of Sindh, Jamshoro

Email: misbahbq@gmail.com

Dr. Zareen Qadir

Assistant Professor Department of Social Work, University of Sindh, Jamshoro

Email: zareen.atta@usindh.edu.pk

ABSTRACT

The purpose of this study was to explore the key limits of labor laws of Pakistan focusing on women domestic workers and gender empowerment. The main objectives of this study include; (a) to investigate the female labor force participation in Pakistan and what factors contribute to low participation (b) to assess the role of and how gender discrimination faced by females in Pakistan, and (c) to assess the labor laws for females in Pakistan and the key limits of labor laws of Pakistan. The research design considered for this study was a secondary qualitative research design, considering this the data was collected from already published sources online such as research papers and reports. The data analysis technique chosen for this study was content analysis and a total of 4 themes were established which offer comprehensive and valuable data findings. The data findings of this study indicated that female labor participation in the case of Pakistan is still very a steady change observed from previous years and the factors that impact female labor participation include; education, social norms, cultural perspectives, lack of financial accessibility, and lack of knowledge and skills, as well as, health ailments.

Keywords: Social Norms, Cultural Perspectives, Health Ailments, Labor Laws.

INTRODUCTION

In the overall world's population, women make up half of the potential labor force in different domains based on their education, cultural perspectives and influence, and norms (Amber and Chichaibelu, 2023). However, a survey by the International Labor Organization (2020) indicated that in different nations the share of the

women's labor force is substantially less around 27% in comparison with the men's labor force in 2019 globally. In South Asia and the Arab States, the inequality in the labor force is massive instead of a significant amount of efforts have been made to reduce the gender gap. In South Asia, the Female Labor Force Participation Rate (FLFPR) estimations have still shown a substantial decline from approximately 26% to 22.8% in the year 2010 to 2023 respectively (International Labor Organization, 2020). These disparities in Asian countries have shown different factors such as geographical location (rural or urban), socio-economic, demographic, education levels, and household size, wealth that impact the decline or fall in the Female Labor Force Participation Rate (FLFPR) as well as assist in addressing the decision of women in the participation in the labor market (Faridi, Malik and Basit, 2009). However, it has also been reported that there are no substantial variations in these factors in the case of Pakistan has shown a strong change and the current statistics by the World Bank indicated 25% participation of female labor in 2022 (World Bank, 2022).

In Pakistan, the substandard performance of labor force participation (LFP) of women is considered the major cause of ranking low in the Global Gender Gap Index i.e. 151 out of 153 according to the survey by the World Economic Forum (2020) concerning gender equality. In addition to this, conservative social attitudes toward females are considered one of the major causes for the lower rate of labor force participation in the case of Pakistan as well as in North Africa and the Middle East (Gaddis and Klasen, 2014). Najeeb, Morales, and Lopez-Acevedo (2020) indicated that education is also considered the major factor in the decreasing rate of female labor force participation since most women left their education after matriculation, indicating that females who are relatively low in qualification have low opportunities in engaging in the labor force of Pakistan. This implies there are substantial factors like gender discrimination, culture, education, wealth, and demographics that have significant associations and effects on the female labor force participation (FLFP) of Pakistan, considering the labor laws in Pakistan (Shahid, 2014; Zia et al., 2017). Thus, this study aims to assess the FLFP of Pakistan and what factors contribute to low participation, the role of and how gender

discrimination is faced by females in Pakistan, as well as, the labor laws for females in Pakistan and the key limits of labor laws of Pakistan.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Gender Discrimination Faced by Females in Pakistan: Gender discrimination in Pakistan is an alarming problem since economic disparity is one of the significant reasons contributing to gender inequality. Socio-cultural humiliated practices, gender stereotyping, home care responsibilities, and women's low status in society are considered the major obstacles and factors linked to gender discrimination in employment opportunities, empowerment, and growth of women (Rabia et al., 2019). Sex-segregated occupational choices, lack of required skills, restriction on mobility, and low education of females are some of the determinants that lead to gender discrimination among men and women in terms of employment as well as in attaining economic opportunities (Adeel, Yeh, and Zhang, 2016). Due to the high prevalence of gender discrimination and inequality, most of the females in Pakistan are out of the labor force and are faced with certain issues in terms of the economic stream (Sarhad and Agric, 2011). Unfavorable work environment and workplace harassment are the most common issues faced by females in comparison with males and due to the leadership positions being mostly given to men, few women are engaged in decision-making as well and lower wages are offered to them (Mahmood, 2012; Iqbal, 2012).

Female Labor Force Participation in Pakistan: Participation in the labor force by females accounts for a decision that is active in the true sense since females begin and end their labor force at various levels in their life due to certain factors for example, changes in the work hours' i.e. full-time or part-time, education level, and because of personal factors (Sarkar, Sahoo and Klasen, 2019). In addition to this, according to the estimations of ILO on labor force participation in Pakistan, in 2019 the FLF Parose to 21.67% from 1990 i.e. 13.95% (World Bank, 2023). The overall unemployment rate for women is 8.3% and for men is 5.1% which is due to certain factors such as school enrolment between women and men, literacy rate, and

education that contribute to the huge gap in FLFP in Pakistan. Pakistan among other South Asian nations has had the lowest rate of FLFP. However it has also been found in the study by Mujahid, Shahbaz, and Shahbaz (2016) that most of the females have been involved in some kind of economic or market activities for instance; transportation, retail trade, and wholesale, domestic work, manufacturing, construction work, and other type of labor. In addition to this, studies have also shown that education and the level of education is one of the key determinants linked to labor force participation (Shaheen, Hussain Sial, and Sarwar Awan, 2011; Khadim and Akram, 2013).

The Key Limits of Labor Laws in Pakistan: There are a significant amount of key limits of labor laws of Pakistan in the working areas of women, for instance, the key constraints may include working or near heavy machinery, prohibitions on women working, work in the mines according to the Mines Act 1923 (Khan, 2017). Other constraints to working women are linked to work timings as well as working hours. The Factories Act 1934 which is applicable in Balochistan, Punjab, and Islamabad, constraints the working hours of women in factories to 9 hours daily, in addition to prohibiting night work and females can only work between 6 am and 7 pm in comparison with men which can work at any time and up to 10 hours. However, in the case of Sindh, females can work where appropriate transport structures are made for them in factories in which they can work up to 10 pm, but in the case of no transportation arrangements, they can only work in factories between 7 am and 7 pm (Admin, 2019). In addition to this, the female workers in shops are also constrained to multiple labor laws that they need to comply with in Pakistan as indicated in the Shops and Establishments Act 2015 (Khyber Pakhtunkhwa), the West Pakistan Shops and Establishments Ordinance 1969 (Punjab, Islamabad, and Balochistan) and the Sindh Shops and Establishment Act 2015. Other laws are defined for female laborers who have child-rearing and childbearing needs. In addition to this, other laws in Pakistan for women include; the West Pakistan Maternity Benefit Ordinance 1958, the Mines Maternity Benefits Act 1941, the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Maternity Benefits Act 2013, the Provincial Employees Social Security Ordinance 1965, the Civil

Servants Act 1973 (Revised Leave Rules 1980) which seeks to offer support to women concerning a period of maternity leave, protection from dismissal, and paid maternity allowances (Khan, 2017). However, these laws lack in offering day-care or childcare facilities for women which needs to be addressed so that the female labor participation in a significant amount and improvements can be administered.

Weak Enforcement of Laws: Most domestic workers need to be made aware of their rights and the laws that should protect them. This is a challenge, especially in ensuring they can take their employers to court and seek remedy in case they have been mistreated. While many domestic workers know their rights, they need the economic means to hire a lawyer, meaning their ability to seek legal remedies is significantly limited. Corruption and inefficiency demonstrated in the formulation and administration of current legislation means that even if the worker files a complaint, he or she is likely to receive a biased trial, or there is no protection of his/her rights. The need to properly implement the existing regulation adds more problems to the lives of female domestic employees at the same time, there is a legal framework protecting their rights. The lack of proper monitoring tools and regulatory checks also let the companies get away with violating labour rights with impunity (Gutiérrez-Rodríguez et al., 2010). Pervasive problems of ineffective enforcement also do not deter exploitative practices and perpetuate impunity where wrongdoers' action goes unnoticed or are not subjected to justice. Improving the implementation of existing laws includes strengthening the agencies that oversee the enforcement of the laws, raising awareness among employers and employees and their rights under the laws, and putting in place measures for reporting and addressing the violations (Perea, 2011). Thus, the mere existence of legislative provisions in Taiwan serves more as empty rhetoric and offers these weak and exploited vulnerable female domestic workers, the core of this issue, no real protection from labour enforcement officials.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

Research Design: The research design in any study is considered the crucial part that assists in answering the research questions formulated and the objectives that need to be achieved. There are

different kinds of research methods including; quantitative research design, qualitative research design, and mixed-method research design which are both quantitative and qualitative (Malhotra, 2017). The quantitative research design aims to offer insights into the statistical and numerical data while the qualitative research design assists in grabbing useful and valuable insights on the non-statistical data either secondary data from already published research papers, reports, official documents, case studies, or government reports or by using primary data uniquely through perceptions and experiences of real participants. The study design chosen for this research is secondary qualitative research which aims to deliver comprehensive knowledge, valuable, and meaningful insights on the gender discrimination faced by females in Pakistan, FLFP in Pakistan, and the key limits of labor laws of Pakistan. In addition to this, the secondary qualitative nature of this research is chosen since it assisted in gaining a huge amount of useful data from various relevant sources linked to key factors that impact FLFP and the key limits of labor laws of Pakistan which in turn enabled the researcher to offer current condition of Pakistan in women empowerment, gender discrimination and legislations and policies established for female workers.

Data Collection Method: Different data-gathering tools depend on the nature of the study design such as interviews, focus groups, and surveys. Since the chosen research design is a qualitative method, the data collection method chose secondary data collection (Taherdoost, 2021). The secondary data is gathered through sources available online i.e. research papers, articles, government reports, official reports, and journals published in previous years. For data collection, a significant number of online research databases were used such as Research Gate, Sage Publication, Springer, Google Scholar, and Elsevier. The data published in the last ten years was collected and retrieved and based on the research title, objectives, research questions, and the overall abstract, final sources were chosen for data analysis. The main search codes during the data collection process were linked to the female labor force participation of Pakistan and factors that contribute to low participation, as well as, the labor laws for females in Pakistan and the key limits of labor laws of Pakistan, and the role of and how gender discrimination faced by females in Pakistan.

Data Analysis Technique: The data analysis method is one of the most important parts of the study which assists in offering a crucial understanding and answer to the research questions and objectives more comprehensively depending on the research design selected (Taherdoost, 2022). Different data analysis techniques can be used such as predictive, inferential, content analysis, experiment analysis, analysis, descriptive analysis, statistical analysis, and others (Taherdoost, 2020). Since the research method and data collection technique chosen for this research was secondary qualitative research, the most useful and suitable form of data analysis technique was content analysis which enabled researchers to comprehensively assess the data. The content analysis approach to this study is considered feasible and most appropriate since the research is more focused on investigating the key limits of labor laws of Pakistan, gender discrimination in Pakistan, the *FLFP of Pakistan*, and factors that contribute to low participation which can be thoroughly answered by obtaining useful patterns, codes, and themes from the sources gathered.

RESULTS & DISCUSSION

Thematic Analysis

Theme-1: Female Labor Force Participation in Pakistan

The FLFP rate in Pakistan according to the Government of Pakistan's Labor Force Survey 2017 to 2018 is around 20.1% in comparison with male labor force participation i.e. approximately 68% (Khan, 2020). Social norms in Pakistan are considered one of the major reasons which detonate female labor force participation which results in decreasing the need to augment household income and increasing the household income. However, the research study by D'Adda et al. (2019) has been carried out to assess the labor force participation in Pakistan and indicated that in Punjab, data from a huge sample of women micro-business owners that women who work or operate businesses within households tend to generate more household income which assists in improving the FLFP and have the potential to generate more economic benefits for the country. The Punjab Commission on Status of Women (PCSW) 2018 surveyed around thirty thousand household members and women to comprehend the

challenges faced by females in their participation in the labor force (Ahmed and Said, 2022).

The survey data indicated that the female labor force's productive capacity is not used effectively. In addition to this, the survey also indicated that two-thirds of the women in the interview those who have been employed part-time and around 11% were looking for work, suggesting a lower rate in terms of FLFP in Pakistan (Ahmed and Said, 2022). In addition to this, another study by Ahmed et al. (2020) was conducted to assess female labor force participation in Pakistan, considering education as the reason behind working and non-working females. The study indicated that in interviews in public arts colleges of Lahore with 2500 females in undergraduate studies, the educated women arguably had more desire to work while others approximately greater than four-fifths (84%) indicated their working desire after graduating. However, the overall survey found comparatively low female labor force participation even among this educated sub-sample (Ahmed et al., 2020).

Theme-2: Factors That Affect Female Labor Force Participation in Pakistan

The Punjab Commission on Status of Women (PCSW) 2018 who interviewed women found significant factors that affect female labor participation in Pakistan. The survey indicated that lack of skills and knowledge is one of the crucial factors that impact female labor participation in Pakistan as approximately 50% of the participants reported this factor and as indicated by 15 percent in Gujranwala's business sample as one of the challenging factors which contributes to low participation (Ahmed and Said, 2022). However, the research study by Cheema et al. (2019) also carried out on the role of knowledge and skills in impacting female participation in the labor force and found that skills training for women when complemented with aid in developing market associations is on the most important and crucial factor that contributes to impacting the female participation, suggesting a potential and substantial elevation in the empowerment of female entrepreneurs as well as yearly income. In addition to this, another factor that has been indicated in the study by

Ahmed and Said (2022) is transportation through safer mediums to and from places of work, mobility outside the household and social norms regarding acceptable occupations for women which contributes to low participation of female labor force. According to the PCSW Survey in 2018, more than 3rd of the sample indicated that women have no accessibility to accommodation near places of work or do not have access to transport. In addition to this, around 35% of the women need permission from their household members to work due to safety concerns reported by household members which impact their work participation. Moreover, another survey carried out by Field (2016) also indicated that 15% of the women reported disliked working outside of their homes themselves, and two-fifths of those who did not work reported their husbands or fathers did not permit to work outside the home. In addition to this, approximately 15% of the businesswomen in Punjab which is significantly a small proportion indicated that health concerns and ailments are the main factors that impact their participation in the labor force, indicating a lack of resource and time dedication to fully operate their businesses (Field and Vyborny, 2016). Moreover, it is also found that lack of accessibility to finance and financial exclusion are the other two challenges faced by the females which impact their participation as working women (Ahmed and Said, 2022). The study by D'Adda et al. (2019) found that 22% of the women faced a lack of funding in doing their own business as reported in a sample with 1400 business-women in Gujranwala.

Theme-3: Gender Discrimination Faced by Female Domestic Workers in Pakistan

Domestic work takes place in personal homes, indicating informal settings that are not similar to the workplace environment in the office setting as well as the settings of a factory where there are no co-workers or no team members but only a domestic worker who tends to do all the activities behind closed doors. The research study by Augustine and Kumar (2016), it has been indicated that because of the unorganized working conditions of domestic workers, they often feel at the mercy and being neglected by their owners in a certain way since most females work as domestic workers in Pakistan so they also face

gender discrimination as well. The gender discrimination faced by females is linked to a vulnerable kind of employment where they feel undervalued due to certain social norms, weak labor protection such as workers' compensation, overtime, minimum wage, and cultural perceptions of the society (ILO, 2016).

There are a significant amount of research studies have also shown that gender discrimination in Pakistan is visible and is linked to abuse, violence, mobility restriction, denial of inheritance rights, early and forced marriages, education, health care, and distribution of food (Bukhari, Gaho and Soomro, 2018; Kazimi, Shaikh and John, 2019). In different sectors of Pakistan, be it private, public, or domestic work, there is gender discrimination faced by women in all sectors. For instance; cultural and biological variables are the most common forms that contribute to gender discrimination as found to be prevalent in the workplace in the private service sector (Akbar et al., 2022). In addition to this, the research findings have also indicated that due to biological differences, the genders are incapable of performing specific tasks in shape. Moreover, the discriminatory behavior towards females in the working environment in Pakistan has hugely been affected due to the rules of the human resource department. This implies that several factors have been found feasible which lead to gender discrimination in the case of Pakistan which in turn impacts the economy and female labor force participation in general.

Theme-4: The Key Limits of Labor Laws in Pakistan

According to estimation, every 4th household in Pakistan has hired a domestic worker, and the National Labor Legislation for Domestic Workers in Pakistan is considered the larger informal sector for working women (Shafeeq, Naz, and Awan, 2022). There are 0.464 million domestic workers in Pakistan according to the Labor Force Survey of Pakistan (2014-15) as reported in the study by Shafeeq, Naz, and Awan (2022) in which 0.364 million of the domestic workers are hired for specific tasks to be carried out them in household or day-based domestic workers while 0.1 million are those domestic workers who live in households. The nature of domestic workers as well as the laws in Pakistan regarding labor is constrained and several factors are not considered for women empowerment and improved female labor

force participation. The study also indicated that Pakistan has sanctioned twenty-six technical conventions of ILO, two governance conventions, and 4 basic conventions. However, Pakistan has not yet ratified Convention 189 which particularly aims and deals with the standards and labor rights for domestic workers which constrains the labor rights of the domestic workers to a certain extent (ILO, 2016). According to the law by the ILO Convention 189 and its Recommendation (201), it is strictly prohibited and hazardous for children under 18 to work in any profession, however, there are multiple households in which domestic workers are under the age of 18 and no strict actions have taken by the government and lawmakers to break this pattern (Shafeeq, Naz, and Awan, 2022). In addition to this, the other constitutions include the Minimum Wages Ordinance of 1961 and the Provincial Employees Social Security Ordinance of 1965 which offers a full definition of workers and their rights in the domestic working which require offering full healthcare facilities to the domestic worker by employers. However, the government of Pakistan has not yet notified these legislative provisions as well as the domestic workers' minimum wages and there is no particular framework offered for its execution and regulation (Shafeeq, Naz, and Awan, 2022).

In addition to this, labor laws in Pakistan under the jurisdiction, another Act i.e. Domestic Workers (Employment Rights) Act in 2017 was passed by the Senate of Pakistan to facilitate domestic workers. The main focus is to safeguard the rights of domestic workers to administer conditions of service and regulate their employment by offering them welfare, health facilities, safety, and social security. However, no registration authority in Pakistan can assist domestic workers in speaking for their rights and protecting their social and health well-being. In addition to this, other laws ratified by International obligations Pakistan consist of the Discrimination (Employment and Occupation) Convention 1958 (No. 111), the Equal Remuneration Convention 1951 (No. 100), and 36 International Labor Conventions which suggest and require different state to guarantee that there will be no inequalities concerning T&C of job, access to employment in any occupation, access to vocational training, and in

terms of wages (Khan, 2017). However, these sanctions still require a strong emphasis by the government of Pakistan since less effort has been paid and a significant amount of workers still face issues with minimum wage criteria, access to employment in any occupation, and access to vocational training. In addition to this, Pakistan on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women became a party to the UN Convention through which it is projected to acquire all suitable initiatives to reduce and fully annihilate discrimination against women including remuneration, training, and recruitment in the field of employment. However, the study by Khan (2017) indicated that these laws and initiatives by the government of Pakistan in different states still require a strong focus on the value and recognition of domestic work and unpaid work which substantially lowers the rights of domestic working women.

DISCUSSION

This study has significantly conducted interviews to gather insights about the key limits of labor laws of Pakistan focusing on women domestic workers and gender empowerment. Regarding this, it was found that females are considerably deprived in the labor force of Pakistan, regardless of the massive contribution they make in their daily lives. Moreover, where females are employed, they tend to face a substantial gap in gender pay, with other types of discrimination that limit the potential (Muhammad et al., 2021). The Provincial Employees Social Security Ordinance 1965 tends to set the accountability of employers for giving medical help to domestic servants according to section 55-A (Abrar ul Haq et al., 2019). There is even the Minimum Wages Ordinance 1961 that involves the ones who are employed in domestic work in the definition of ‘worker’ (Bukhari et al., 2019). However, the implementation of the Ordinance for female domestic employees is quite unclear, and no additional measures are taken to specify the lowest salary that applies to such domestic workers.

A Bill for extending labor protections to domestic laborers was led by the Senate in the year 2013, however, is pending (Choudhry et al., 2019). The Domestic Workers Bill based on Employment Rights

regulates the terms and conditions of the work, wages as well as rest periods, with the provision of accessibility to the remedies by a planned disagreement resolution committee. However, the study by Naseem et al. (2021) also proved that it is unfortunate for women that they are deprived of these lawful implementations. Establishing networks, supporting groups and organizations to bring advancement in the interests of women domestic workers is difficult. The findings of this article are triangulated with the study of (Abbas and Muneer, 2019). It has been discussed that there are labor laws that even encourage the empowerment of women and basic rights for the women domestic workers however, their implementation is weak. In the year 2014, there was been prime ever union of the domestic workers that was made in Pakistan, through the Home-Net Pakistan (Choudhry et al., 2019).

A significant number of domestic workers lack awareness of their entitlements and the legal safeguards that ensure their protection. This poses a challenge for them in terms of holding their employers responsible and pursuing remedies for any mistreatment. Despite their awareness of their rights, numerous domestic workers lack the financial means to secure legal counsel, thereby severely constraining their capacity to pursue legal recourse. Inadequate implementation of current legislation as a result of corruption and incompetence within the judicial system implies that even if a worker lodges a complaint, there is less assurance of obtaining a just hearing or having their rights protected. The inadequate enforcement of existing rules exacerbates the difficulties encountered by female domestic workers, despite the presence of legal protections for their rights. The absence of efficient monitoring tools and regulatory control enables unscrupulous companies to flagrantly disregard labor regulations without facing any consequences (Gutiérrez-Rodríguez et al., 2010).

It refers to a network of organizations that support home-based workers through the facilitation of the Pakistan Workers Federation. Moreover, domestic workers, which were drawn mainly from Rawalpindi, had come together to form the prime collective organization for this (Muhammad et al., 2021). Significantly, referring to the advocacy agenda, it is considered legislative reform as well as

effective lawmaking implementation. Such organizations can take possible initiatives as well as rationalize efforts of female domestic employees in the appropriate direction. Referring to Article 17 of the Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan, all the citizens have the authority to form associations or unions, subjective to the rational limitations that are compulsory through the law in the interest of the dominion or even truthfulness of Pakistan, the public order or ethics (Jabeen et al., 2020).

In this regard, the Home-Net Pakistan organization is playing a central role in linking women in domestic services to the trade unions since the collaboration with the trade unions can give a basis for bigger groups of domestic workers. The lack of effective enforcement not only fails to discourage exploitative practices but also sustains a culture of impunity, where wrongdoers face few repercussions for their conduct. Enhancing the enforcement of current legislation entails bolstering the capabilities of regulatory bodies, increasing knowledge among employers and workers regarding their rights and responsibilities, and providing mechanisms for reporting and resolving infractions (Perea, 2011). In the absence of strong enforcement, the legislative safeguards only exist in theory and provide minimal practical assistance to the vulnerable female domestic workers who are central to this problem. Many associations as well as centers that are committed to women's empowerment in domestic services are required in Pakistan. These associations can assist workers in getting jobs, solve their disputes among employers as well as domestic workers, run awareness campaigns, as well as provide training (Sarkar, 2020). All this can happen if any such association puts forward its efforts based on the laws made that favor women domestic workers and gender empowerment.

Women domestic worker organizations can benefit from experiences as well as many strategies that are adopted through the organizations who work at the international level, like 'INTERCEDE' that is in Canada, Break the Chain Campaign for Domestic Workers Rights in the US, 'KALAYAAN' in the UK, as well as (NDWM) that is the National Women Domestic Workers Movement in India (Shahid, 2019). All these use labor laws to

promote the rights of female domestic workers and ensure they get equal salaries with better working conditions. In addition, these women can be helped through the provision of the Zakat system in Pakistan (Sarwar and Imran, 2019). Zakat is gathered by the banks as well as the Government of Pakistan has made the Central Zakat Council oversee the amount gathering along with the disbursement of Zakat on the federal, district, provincial, as well as local levels. These Zakat funds can be given to domestic women workers. Apart from this, the Government of Pakistan must adopt the Gender Code for Harassment at Workplace Act 2010 for women domestic workers who are victims of gender-based violence in their daily routines (Nawaz et al., 2021).

RECOMMENDATIONS

Regular Monitoring and Enforcement: First, it is crucial that regular monitoring is done on any of the strategies developed or any of the Programs constructed to deal with such issues. Enforcement and the courts must be strengthened to ensure that regular monitoring is done effectively. Law enforcers and judicial parties need special training focusing on power dynamics, domestic work, and management of victim issues. Such practices should include investigative training, case management of the vulnerable, Population and timely regulation of judicial practices. Establishing DW harassment courts and tribunals can help in achieving these goals.

Establishment of Support Mechanisms: Legal services, counseling, and reporting mechanisms should be created for these women because their working conditions are unstable. Promoting sexual harassment hotlines or help lines for domestic employment may be pursued as an option. These hotlines must be operational as separate centers to ensure that the privacy of the victims is observed. Refugees for persons at risk or experiencing violence must be created. NGOs could develop and manage such safe spaces in collaboration with relevant government bodies. These shelters should offer victims physical protection and psychological and emotional support to enable them to deal with harassment.

Education & Awareness Program: Through training modules for domestic workers and an understanding of the outcomes of

harassment in the workplace, the proper training for detecting and reporting harassment should be provided to empower them. In Jamshoro especially, there should be frequently organized seminars and awareness campaigns for women, where many of them are domestic servants, and they might end up being harassed because of their illiteracy and impoverished backgrounds.

Collaboration with Employers and Community Leaders: Creating awareness at the company and local government level is critical in order to get their support in the fight against sexual harassment. If employers are engaged in programs that promote equality in handling domestic workers, fair wages for domestic workers, and job security, it could alter people's perception of handling this aspect of domestic work. This involves appealing to employers and families to ensure they practice ethical sourcing of employees and adhere to gender-related conventions. Churches, city councils, and other authorities, together with political and cultural leaders, should advocate for women to be house helpers. It shows that their effect can significantly change the entire community's attitude and the perception of oneself and others. Domestic workers, employers, and community members can develop sessions where everyone can speak about respectful and safer working environments.

Corporate Social Responsibility Initiatives: By motivating enterprises and organizations, CSR programs may help enforce safe practices for female domestic workers. Employers must ensure that their employees are healthy and include incentives to ensure this factor is achieved, especially if the business undertakes domestic work for private houses. Corporate ethics policies must indicate ethical approaches in the recruitment process and the non-acceptance of harassment practices. They should fund sponsorship programs for education and skill development among female domestic workers and fully engage in community initiatives. This element highlights that employers may fight stereotyping and promotes reciprocity in the context of domestic employees.

Strengthening Legal Frameworks and Policies: The law needs to be effectively enhanced to accommodate the protection of the aspects of sexual harassment of domestic workers. Creating broad guidelines that are in compliance with international standards and

conventions may also benefit these workers by improving their rights and conditions. These are clear definitions of sexual harassment, severe offender penalties, and reporting and remedial measures. Through awareness programs, more information and education about the rights of domestic workers under this new legislation should also be sought. Some possible ways to spread information include: This helps improve the working conditions of domestic workers and ensure people are treated well in their homes.

Laws Enforcement and Judiciary Capacity Building: Therefore, for the laws against sexual harassment of female domestic workers to be efficiently implemented, law enforcement and the courts need to be empowered. The police and judiciary should receive professional education on domestic work, power relations, and the victim 'smatter. This includes sensitive investigation training, care for vulnerable people, and faster justice. Forming Domestic worker harassment courts or tribunals may also enhance efficiency and expedite justice.

CONCLUSION

This research was carried out to assess the role of gender discrimination in Pakistan, the women's labor force participation, and what factors contribute to low participation, as well as, the labor laws for females in Pakistan and the key limits of labor laws of Pakistan. To conduct this research, the research design selected for this study was qualitative research design and the data collection method was secondary data using a significant number of databases like Google Scholar, Springer, Research Gate, and Sage publication. For the collection of research papers and reports, previously published ten years was considered feasible for this study. The data analysis technique used for this study was content analysis which assisted in getting useful, valuable, and meaningful insights on the labor laws and their key limitations in general as well as concerning domestic workers, particularly in the case of Pakistan. In addition to this, the content analysis also offered useful insights into the role of gender discrimination in Pakistan and how it affects Pakistani females. Moreover, other content analysis themes were linked to female labor force participation in Pakistan and how it affects female labor force

participation in Pakistan specifically. Women are even likely to work in an informal economy, free from labor laws, and thus are vulnerable to many forms of exploitation, involving low wages and gender discrimination. Moreover, socio cultural humiliation practices, gender stereotyping, home care responsibilities, and the low status of women in society are all the major obstacles and factors linked to gender discrimination in employment opportunities for women. Sex-based occupational choices, inadequate needed skills, restrictions on mobility, including the low education of females are a few factors that contribute to gender discrimination among men and women regarding employment as well as in attaining economic opportunities as per the high prevalence of gender discrimination and inequality, many females in Pakistan are out of the labor force who tends to face with certain issues based on the economic stream. Thus, unfavorable working environments, as well as workplace harassment, are the dominant issues through which females have to suffer in comparison with males. Based on these findings, it is suggested that Pakistani laws must be executed, ensuring to have strong monitoring and evaluation.

REFERENCES

- Abbas, A. and Muneer, L., (2019). Women empowerment in South Asia: Role of women in the development of Pakistan. *International Journal of Research in Humanities and Social Studies*, 6(2), pp.42-49.
- AbrarulHaq, M., Akram, F., Ashiq, U. and Raza, S., (2019). The employment paradox to improve women's empowerment in Pakistan. *Cogent Social Sciences*, 5(1), p.1707005.
- Adeel, M., Yeh, A.G.O. and Zhang, F. (2016). Gender inequality in mobility and mode choice in Pakistan. *Transportation*, 44(6), pp.1519–1534. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11116-016-9712-8>
- Admin, (2019). *Factories Act, 1934*. [Online] Pakistan Lawyer. Available at: <https://pakistanlawyer.com/factories-act-1934/> [Accessed 26 Dec. 2023].
- Ahmed, H., Mahmud, M., Said, F. and Tirmazee, Z., (2020). Undergraduate Female Students in Lahore: Perceived Constraints to Female Labor Force Participation. Lahore School of Economics.
- Ahmed, K. and Said, F. (2022). Directed by Funded by Increasing productivity in Pakistan through a gender and vulnerability lens. [Online] Available at: <https://www.theigc.org/sites/default/files/2022/08/Ahmed-and-Said-Policy-Brief-August-2022.pdf> [Accessed 26 Dec. 2023].
- Akbar, M., Nasir, F., Aslam, M. and Qasim, I. (2022). Effect of Family Pressure, Peer Pressure, and Media Pressure on Body Image Dissatisfaction among

- Women. *Journal of Business and Social Review in Emerging Economies*, 8(2), 325-330.
- Amber, H. and Chichaibelu, B.B. (2023). Patterns and Causes of Female Labor Force Participation: An Age–Period–Cohort Analysis for Pakistan. *Population Research and Policy Review*, 42(2). doi: <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11113-023-09751-9>
- Augustine, R., & Singh, R. K. (2016). Condition & problems of female domestic workers (with special reference to LDA colony in Lucknow City, India). *Journal of Sociology and Social Work*, 4(2), 110-117.
- Bukhari, A.H.S., Gaho, G.M. and Soomro, K.H. (2018). Gender Inequality Problems & Its Solutions in Pakistan. *Research Journal of Political Science*, 7, 47-58. - References - Scientific Research Publishing.
- Bukhari, M.A.H.S., Gaho, M.G.M. and Soomro, M. K. H., (2019). Gender inequality: problems & its solutions in Pakistan. *The Government-Annual Research Journal of Political Science*.
- Cheema, A., Khwaja, A.I, Naseer, F. and Shapiro, J. N. (2019). Skills for Market (SFM 2013-14) – Market Linkage (ML 2015-16): *Final Impact Report*. Available at Punjab Skills Development Fund (PSDF) website: <https://www.psd.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2020/03/SFM-ML-FinalImpact-Evaluation-Report-1.pdf>
- Choudhry, A.N., Abdul Mutalib, R. and Ismail, N.S.A., (2019). Socio-cultural factors affecting women's economic empowerment in Pakistan: A situation analysis. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 9(5), pp.90-102.
- Choudhry, A.N., Abdul Mutalib, R. and Ismail, N.S.A., (2019). Socio-cultural factors affecting women's economic empowerment in Pakistan: A situation analysis. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 9(5), pp.90-102.
- D’Adda, G., Mahmud M., Said F., and Ubfal D., (2019). Constraints to female entrepreneurship in Pakistan: The role of women’s goals and aspirations.
- Faridi, M. Z., Malik, S., and Basit, A. B. 2009. Impact of Education on Female Labor Force Participation in Pakistan: Empirical Evidence from Primary Data Analysis. In *Pakistan Journal of Social Sciences (PJSS)* (Vol. 29, Issue 1).
- Field, E. and Vyborny, K., (2016). Female labor force participation in Asia: Pakistan country study. Manila: Asian Development Bank.
- Gutierrez-Rodriguez, E. (2010). Migration, domestic work and affect: A neocolonial approach on value and the feminization of labor (Vol. 26). Routledge.
- Gaddis, I., and Klasen, S. (2014). Economic development, structural change, and women’s labor force participation: A re-examination of the feminization U hypothesis. *Journal of Population Economics*, 27(3), 639–681. Available at: <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00148-013-0488-2>

- ILO 2016. Women at Work: Trends (2016). International Labor Office-Geneva.
- International Labor Organization. (2020). World Employment and Social Outlook: Trends 2020. In International Labor Organization.
- Iqbal, H. (2012). Gender Discrimination: Implications for Pakistan Security. *IOSR Journal of Humanities and Social Science*, 1(4), pp.16-25. doi: <https://doi.org/10.9790/0837-0141625>
- Jabeen, S., Haq, S., Jameel, A., Hussain, A., Asif, M., Hwang, J. and Jabeen, A., (2020). Impacts of rural women's traditional economic activities on household economy: Changing economic contributions through empowered women in rural Pakistan. *Sustainability*, 12(7), p.2731.
- Kazimi, A.B., Shaikh, M.A. and John, S. (2019). Mother's Role and Perception in Developing Gender Discrimination. *Global Political Review*, [Online] 4(2), pp.20–28. Available at: <https://ideas.repec.org/a/aaw/gprjrn/v4y2019i2p20-28.html>
- Khadim, Z., and Akram, W. (2013). Female Labor Force Participation in Formal Sector: Empirical Evidence from PSLM (2007-08). *Middle-East Journal of Scientific Research*, 14(11), 1480–1488. Available at: <https://doi.org/10.5829/idosi.mejsr.2013.14.11.2337>
- Khan, F. (2017). *Barriers to pay equality in Pakistan*. [Online] Available at: https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---asia/---ro-bangkok/---ilo-islamabad/documents/publication/wcms_554791.pdf
- Khan, T. (2020). *Female Labor Migration From Pakistan: A Situation Analysis*. [Online] Available at: https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_protect/---protrav/---migrant/documents/publication/wcms_735795.pdf.
- Mahmood, B. (2012). Gender Specific Barriers to Female Entrepreneurs in Pakistan: A Study in Urban Areas of Pakistan. *British Journal of Education, Society & Behavioral Science*, 2(4), pp.339–352. doi: <https://doi.org/10.9734/bjesbs/2012/2128>
- Malhotra, G. 2017. Strategies in Research. In *International Journal of Advance Research and Development*. Available at: <https://www.ijarnd.com/manuscripts/v2i5/V2I5-1220.pdf>
- Muhammad, F., Bano, K., Muhammad, K. and Baig, T., (2021). Women empowerment in Pakistan: assessing the socio-economic determinants. *Studies of Applied Economics*, 39(3).
- Muhammad, F., Bano, K., Muhammad, K. and Baig, T., (2021). Women empowerment in Pakistan: assessing the socio-economic determinants. *Studies of Applied Economics*, 39(3).
- Mujahid, M., Shahbaz, S.M., & Shahbaz, M. (2016). Labor Market Conditions– Women Labor Supply Nexus: The Role of Globalization in Pakistan, *Global Business Review* 1(17), 68-87.
- Najeeb, F., Morales, M., and Lopez-Acevedo, G. (2020). Analyzing Female Employment Trends in South Asia (Issue 12956).

- Naseem, F., Nosheen, F. and Malik, N., (2021). Women economic empowerment in Pakistan: a critical analysis of legal framework. *Pakistan Journal of Social Research*, 3(3), pp.77-88.
- Nawaz, S., Koser, M., Boota, A. and Shabbir, M.S., (2021). The effects of cultural limitations, constitution, feminism, and sexual orientation status among the women in Pakistani families. *Pakistan Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences*, 9(3), pp.526-534.
- Perea, J.F. (2011). The echoes of slavery: Recognizing the racist origins of the agricultural and domestic worker exclusion from the National Labor Relations Act. *Ohio St. LJ*, 72, p.95.
- Rabia, M., Tanveer, F., Gillani, M., Naeem, H. and Akbar, S. (2019). Gender Inequality: A Case Study in Pakistan. *Open Journal of Social Sciences*, 07(03), pp.369–379. doi: <https://doi.org/10.4236/jss.2019.73031>
- Sarhad, J., and Agric. (2011). Impact of Gender Discrimination on Gender Development ad Poverty Alleviation. [Online] 27(2). Available at: https://www.aup.edu.pk/sj_pdf/27-IMPACT%20OF%20GENDER%20DISCRIMINATION%20ON%20GENDER.pdf
- Sarkar, S., (2020). The New Legal World of Domestic Work. *Yale JL & Feminism*, 32, p.1.
- Sarkar, S., Sahoo, S., and Klasen, S. (2019). Employment transitions of women in India: A panel analysis. *World Development*, 115, 291–309.
- Sarwar, A. and Imran, M.K., (2019). Exploring Women’s multi-level career prospects in Pakistan: Barriers, interventions, and outcomes. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 10, p.1376.
- Shafeeq N., Naz F. Dr., and Awan R. (2022). Doing the Dirty Work: The Experiences of Female Domestic Workers in Pakistan. *Journal of Development and Social Sciences*, 3(II). doi: [https://doi.org/10.47205/jdss.2022\(3-ii\)17](https://doi.org/10.47205/jdss.2022(3-ii)17)
- Shaheen, S., Hussain Sial, M., and Sarwar Awan, M. (2011). Female Labor Force Participation in Pakistan: A Case of Punjab. *Journal of Social and Development Sciences*, 2(3), 1–47.
- Shahid, A. (2014). Exploring the Limits of Law: Gender Empowerment and Women Domestic Workers in Pakistan.
- Shahid, A., (2019). The socio-legal implications of women's work in the informal sector: a case study of women domestic workers in Pakistan. SSRN.
- Taherdoost, H. (2021). Data Collection Methods and Tools for Research: A Step-by-Step Guide to Choose Data Collection Technique for Academic and Business Research Projects. *International Journal of Academic Research in Management (IJARM)*, 10(1), 10–38.
- Taherdoost, H. (2022). Different Types of Data Analysis; Data Analysis Methods and Techniques in Research Projects. Papers.ssrn.com

- The Mines Act. (1923). Mines (Prohibition of Female Labor Underground) Ordinance 1937.
- World Bank (2023). Labor force participation rate, female (% of female population ages 15+) (modeled ILO estimate) - Pakistan | Data. [Online] Available at: <https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/SL.TLF.CACT.FE.ZS?locations=PK>
- World Bank. (2022). Labor force participation rate, female (% of female population ages 15+) (modeled ILO estimate) - Pakistan | Data. [Online] Available at: <https://www.data.worldbank.org/indicator/SL.TLF.CACT.FE.ZS?locations=PK>
- World Economic Forum. (2020). Global Gender Gap Report 2020. Available at: http://www3.weforum.org/docs/WEF_GGGR_2020.pdf
- Zia, M., Researchers, L., Saqib Bhatti, M. and Riaz, M. (2017). Gender Review of Labor Law [Online] Available at: <http://piler.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2017/02/Gender-Review-of-Labor-Laws.pdf> [Accessed 23 Dec. 2023].
-