

## **GOOD GOVERNANCE IN PAKISTAN DURING AYUB KHAN'S RULE (1958-1969)**

**Ghulam Ali Gabol** \*  
**Dr. Amir Ali Chandio** \*\*

### **Abstract**

*There were problems in Pakistan from the beginning, hence maintaining of good governance remained the major issue from 1947 to 1969. The founder and governor general Jinnah focused over improving governance. In 1951 General Muhammad Ayub Khan was made Pakistan Army's Commander-in Chief. Seven prime ministers served between 1947 to October 1958 but the issues pertaining to rule of law, justice, transparency, accountability and protection of human rights etc were not properly handled. Ayub ruled the country from 1958 to 1969. The people were allowed to participate in the local government elections. Effective measures were taken to minimize corruption. Introduction of presidential system, land reforms and new industrial plants were for maintaining good governance. Ayub Khan's rule was significant in the Cold War era. Pakistan made progress and development in economy. This paper would analyze good governance in Muhammad Ayub Khan's rule during 1958-1969.*

**Key words:** *Good Governance, Ayub Khan, Development, Constitution, Participation, Corruption.*

### **1. Introduction**

The word 'governance' is another word or alternative for the word 'power' for making easy the process of controlling the country and for ruling the people.

\* PhD Scholar, Shah Abdul Latif University, Khairpur. ghulamaligabol@gmail.com

\*\* Faculty of Department of Political Science, Shah Abdul Latif University, Khairpur. amir.chandio@salu.edu.pk

“Governance determines who has power, which makes decisions, how other players make their voice heard and how account is rendered” (Kaleem, 2016, p. 17).

For changing the poor status of governance the term ‘good governance’ was made popular by donor agencies i.e. the World Bank, International Monetary Fund, Asian Development Bank and the UNO and by the governments of the USA and by developed European countries. The concept of good governance was old but it became a famous term for improving governance throughout the developing countries when the Cold War ended. Following the principles and elements of good governance was made compulsory for aid receiving countries. Developing countries were given instructions by donor agencies for holding timely and fair elections, maintaining law and order, implementing rule of law, introducing mechanism of speedy justice and controlling corruption, providing information and basic facilities and controlling violence. For achieving these objectives good governance is part and parcel of agenda for improving the system of poor governance. Economic governance is for boosting up economy. Political governance and institutional governance are required for solving the problems of the people.

During beginning decade of Cold War era Pakistan emerged on August 14, 1947. “The Pakistan (Provisional Constitution) Order, 1947 established the federation of Pakistan which included (1) the four provinces of East Bengal, West Punjab, Sindh, and the North-West Frontier Province (Khyber Pakhtunkhwa); (2) Balochistan; (3) any other areas that might with the consent of the federation be included therein; (4) the capital of the federation, Karachi; and (5) such Indian states that must accede to the federation.” (Khan, 2016, p.61)

There was social and political competition between Socialistic and Capitalistic blocks. Improving governance was depending on these ideological frameworks. Lodhi (2016, p. 24) writes the words of Quaid-i-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah as under:

*“We are starting with this fundamental principle that we are all citizens and equal citizens of one state... My guiding principle will be justice and complete impartiality, and I am sure that with your support and co-operation, I can look forward to Pakistan becoming one of the greatest nations of the world.”*

The death of Founder Jinnah brought political problems during 1948. Colonial inherited bureaucracy increased its status and power and it created hurdles in the way of democracy. On January 17, 1951 General Ayub was made the Commander-in-Chief. New President Ghulam Muhammad assumed the responsibilities and Iskandar entered in the circles of power. Pakistan fell to political instability. Hence, seven prime ministers served from August 14, 1947 to October 7, 1958.

## **2. Social Development**

“In 1947, the total population of the country was 32.5 million.” (Shahid, 1995, p. 113). Population of urban areas was quite less than rural regions of the country. Areas of rural were mostly deprived of roads, schools and hospitals.

Siddiqui, (2017, p. 47) writes:

*“there were only 8,413 primary schools, 2,190 middle, and 408 secondary schools, 40 colleges, and 2 universities in the areas constituting Pakistan.”*

After discussing in detail the issues of school, college and university education, several committees were formed during the first Conference of Education in 1947. In 1951 according to first population census the population of Pakistan was estimated in 33,816 thousands.

Particular attention was paid for increasing literacy ratio and uplifting the education of the people. In hundreds primary level schools were established. The definition of literacy in 1951 was “one who can read a clear print in any language.” Basic education was the need of the masses.

## **3. Increase in Corruption and Worse Law and Order Condition**

There were challenges of corruption and law and order before the democratic governments. Democratic governments faced political violence which included Hindu-Muslim riots of 1947-48, In 1951 Bengali-Urdu language riots and in Punjab Muslim-Ahmedi conflicts. Violence created panic in the country. Problem of rehabilitation of refugees sought special focus of the government. One of the biggest issues was constitution framing which was solved in 1956. In democratic governments the problems of the shortage of food; issue of economic development issue of establishing of institutions were emerged. PRODA or the Public and the Representative Offices (Disqualification) Act, 1949, PSO or the Public Safety Ordinance, 1949 and SOP Act or the Security of Pakistan Act 1952

were put into force to control violence and misuse of resources; malpractices; abuse of power and corruption etc. Opposition blamed the Muslim League governments for misusing these Ordinances and Acts in the name of accountability.

The political differences arose between the provincial governments and the central government over share of power under the framework of federation. In three provinces i.e. East Pakistan, Punjab and Sindh the Governor Rule was imposed. The people of smaller provinces aggrieved over decision of making West Pakistan province in 1955. Sindhi, Baloch, Pashtun and Seraiki people had struggled democratically for their oppressed rights of provincial status and for more provincial autonomy.

#### **4. Economy**

Sources of wealth particularly trade and business firms and companies were mostly under possession of Hindus, Sikhs and European businessmen before independence.

“Most of the Hindu-owned banks and trading corporations active in the Pakistan area before Independence withdrew their capital and personnel before partition.” (Hussain, 2017, p.474)

The industrial units were in poor condition. Human resources were unskilled and low educated. Agriculture was only the major sector of economy. In July 1948 the establishment of State Bank proved helpful for maintaining economic stability through introducing efficient monetary management. The Planning Advisory Board and the Development Board came into being in 1948.

“A Six Year Development Plan was formulated in 1950 and embodied in the Colombo Plan for Cooperative Economic Development in South and South-East Asia.” (Jalal, 2016, p.421)

In 1953 Planning Board of Pakistan came into being. For the period 1955-1960 the First Five year Plan was approved in April 1957. It failed to reduce economic differences and disparity between two wings. Agriculture sector was deprived of proper attention. Industrial sector was newly taking roots whose productivity was higher in the first decade. No proper planning was made to decrease poverty in the country.

“While in the 1950s... the poverty growth rates were higher in rural than in the urban sectors.” (Husain , 2011 a, p. 187).

Growth by period from 1948-1958 was as below:

“Real GDP 3.1 (per cent), Agriculture 1.6 (percent), Industry 9.1 (per cent) and Services 3.4 (per cent)” (Husain, 2018 b, p.63)

The period of 1948 to 1958 was an era of political disruption. A series of prime ministers change created unfavorable conditions particularly for long term plans of social and economic development. Some financial institutions were established.

### **5. Constitution of 1956**

The first Constitution was framed and finally enforced on March 23, 1956. It was one of the remarkable achievements in country's history. 1956 Constitution made Pakistan an Islamic Republic with unicameral parliament and there were two provinces in the federation. Two National languages i.e. Urdu and Bengali were recognized. Balochi, Sindhi, Seraiki, Pashto and Punjabi languages were deprived of such status. The people of West Pakistan demanded for acknowledging Balochi, Sindhi, Pashto, Seraiki and Punjabi languages as Pakistani National languages. These languages have history of thousands of years.

“Though the 1956 constitution was based, principally, on the pattern of the Government of India Act, inasmuch it gave to the Governor-General power to appoint the Prime Minister and to dissolve the assembly, it laid special emphasis on its Islamic features which were: 1. The state was named as the Islamic Republic of Pakistan. 2. The Head of the State was to be a Muslim. 3. There was a recital of in the preamble of the constitution, taken from the Objective Resolution, that sovereignty over the entire Universe belongs to Allah Almighty alone and that the authority to be exercised by the people of Pakistan within the limits prescribed by Him is a sacred trust. That the principles of democracy, freedom, equality, tolerance and social justice as enunciated by Islam, were to be fully observed” (Munir, 1980, p. 77).

### **6. Martial Law during 1958-1962**

The Prime Minister Feroz made a plan of holding elections. President felt that he would not remain in power. Before implementation of the plan of holding of

elections the Prime Minister was dismissed. Dissolution of Parliament and decision of announcing Martial Law under General Ayub by the President on 7th October of 1958 were dangerous to the process of democracy.

## **7. Muhammad Ayub Khan's Rule (1958-1969)**

It was 27th October of 1958, the removal of President took place and the control of the country was held by CMLA General Ayub Khan.

### **7.1 Reforms for Development**

Reforms were announced by President General Muhammad Ayub Khan to improve governance in administrative, social and economic areas.

“He reorganized Pakistan’s bureaucracy, initiated land reforms, introduced new legal and educational reforms, and prompted foreign investment in the country’s industrial sector. He also gained the support of the United States government that launched multi-purpose development programs in Pakistan. With Ayub’s support, American advisors became a significant presence in land reclamation, rearranging government structure, education and family planning” (Jalal, 2016, p. 287).

For developing agriculture sector Agriculture Development Bank and other new institutions were established. The ‘Council of Islamic Ideology (CCI)- the constitutionally body was established for providing legal advice on issues relating to Islam.

New education policy was given by the Commission on National Education, 1959. It included: “The provision of equal facilities in terms of quantity and quality for the education of boys and girls” (Siddiqui, 2017, p.118).

### **7.2 People's Participation**

During Martial Law period (1958-1962) the system of local government was introduced having basis on controlled democracy.

“The Basic Democracies Order of 1959 envisaged a form of local self-government. Basic democrats were directly elected through popular vote in designated constituencies. They in turn elected the upper levels of a four-tiered organization under the supervision of the civil bureaucracy. Initially there were 80,000 Basic Democrats, 40,000 each from West and East Pakistan. The number was expanded to 120,000 subsequently (Jalal, 2016, p.64).

The Local government was not alternative of democracy. Policies were made without participation of the people. People's voice was unheard and opposition was not allowed to criticize on the policies of the government. Press was not free. Presidential election of 1965 was criticized by the opposition at large scale.

Smith (2009, p. 148) writes:

“It was clear to everyone in Pakistan and around the world that in a democratic election Ayub Khan would probably have been defeated. So, in spite of his victory, Ayub Khan's position was actually weakened by the election.”

### **7.3 Corruption**

For controlling corruption and malpractices ‘Public Offices Disqualification Order (PODO), 1959’ was made effective from March 21, 1959.

“As a result, disciplinary action was taken by way of dismissal, compulsory retirement, and reduction in grade against about three thousand government servants, including 138 first class civil officers, 221 officers of the second class and 1,303 third class employees” (Khan, 2016, p.163).

Mostly all the senior politicians and leaders of the opposition parties were disqualified from holding any position through politics under ‘Elective Bodies Disqualifications Order (EBDO), 1959’. EBDO was made effective from August 14, 1947. There was no transparency in use of. PODO/EBDO. Ayub had failed in introducing proper mechanism for accountability for all on board.

### **8. Constitution of 1962**

After forty –four months of his rule, President General Ayub Khan gave 1962 Constitution to Pakistani nation which emphasized on presidential system. Lifting of the Martial Law allowed the the political activities in the country.

Munir (1980, p. 83) writes:

*“Ayub Khan promulgated his constitution in the first week of May 1962. In this Constitution there were no fundamental rights and the word “Islamic” had been omitted from the name of the State”*

### **9. War of 1965**

In 1965 Pakistan fought against India the war over Kashmir between Pakistan and India. After agreement of both countries over the restoration of pre-war

boundaries under ‘Tashkent Declaration’ in January 1966, the situation changed for Ayub. After that, Ayub Khan’s political status and position became weak internally.

### **10. Bureaucracy**

Bureaucracy and close allies of Ayub Khan’s dictatorship became dominant on various resources of economy and wealth. Some industrial units, business firms, financial companies and most part of State lands particularly in areas of command of Guddu Barrage and Kotri Barrage (in Sindh) were occupied by bureaucracy. Economy was enhanced but mostly a few families enjoyed the financial benefits. State lands were not allotted to landless haris (peasants). Some particular families of elite class, businessmen, industrialists, landlords, Sardars/ Chaudhries/ Maliks/ Nawabs, and bureaucrats were the most beneficiaries from the resources and finance.

“Even after prolonged periods of military rule, which promised prosperity, the outcomes indicators in education, health, clean water and sanitation did not see substantial improvement” (Ahmed, 2017, p. 23).

### **11. Decade of Development**

Ayub Khan’s government made big claims of ‘Decade of Development’ for the period from October 1958 to October 1968. In reality, the poor people had no access to the development of economy.

“Dr. Mahbabul-ul-Haq, Chief Economist of the Planning Commission, disclosed that twenty families controlled 66 per cent of the entire industrial capital, 80 per cent of the banking and 97 per cent of insurance capital” (Rizvi, 2000, p. 183).

#### **11.1 Political Unrest**

The people were unhappy with Ayub Khan’s dictatorship. Grievances of provinces increased against the central government. Constitutionally Pakistan was declared federation but provinces/federating units were greatly deprived of their due share in power. The Bengalis in East Pakistan had concerns over the monopoly of bureaucrats and elitists of West Pakistan in the federal government under Ayub Khan. There were protests by anti-One Unit Movement in cities and towns of Sindh, in Baluchistan and in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (then part of West



Pakistan) for the restoration of former status of provinces. There were democratic movements in developing countries during the Cold war.

“On the international level, the struggle between capitalism and socialism, freedom struggle of colonial countries, hidden and open struggle between feudal lords and emerging trader comprador capitalistic class within Pakistan, and new production relations and new productive forces, gave birth to the new ideas, new ideologies and a new consciousness. All these factors turned the urge for a change, for a better life, for democracy and freedom into a great material force in 1968, a great mass movement burst out, and the three naked exploiters, that is imperialist supremacy, feudal system and the monopoly capitalism became the primary target of this movement” (Ali, 2003, p. 27).

Street power was observed through holding big rallies and shutter down strikes during 1968-69 anti-Ayub Movement of the opposition parties in both provinces in East Pakistan and in West Pakistan. There was lawlessness and disorder in the country. On the 25th day of March in 1969 Ayub resigned and power held by Army Chief General Muhammad Yahya Khan. Constitution of 1962 was abrogated and Martial Law was promulgated. For pacifying the people of West Pakistan One Unit was abrogated on 28 November 1969 and four provinces in Western wing were restored. People's participation in decision making was firstly given in the history of the country through holding General elections in December 1970. For taking power in favor of the largest parliamentary party Awami League, the violence outburst in East Pakistan. Indian aggression was responsible behind disintegration of Eastern Wing from Pakistan in 1971.

In Pakistan poverty (in per cent) was as under:

	“Rural Poor	Urban Poor	Total
1963-4	42.6	48.89	40.24
1966-7	49.6	5.99	44.50
1969-70	50.7	42.55	46.53”

(Hussain, 2011, p. 232)

More attention was paid during 1958-71 for making country self-sufficient in food and economically strong but the masses had less access to benefits of resources.

Growth by period from 1958-1970 was as under:

“Real GDP 5.9 (Per cent), Agriculture 4.4 (per cent), Industry 9.5 (per cent) (and Services 6.0 (per cent)” (Husain, 2018, p. 62).

Efforts were made to groom new political elite and support was sought from civil bureaucracy and judiciary. This collusion hindered the development of democracy. It left bad impressions on socio-economic and institutional development. Individuals were given priority to institutions. Democracy and good governance were not prioritized which caused disintegration of the country.

## **12. Conclusion**

Pakistan inherited poor institutions of governance after independence. There was powerful bureaucracy which was appointed during the British colonial rule. There were problems of new structure of government, and other state affairs. Pakistan faced all challenges boldly. After 13 months of independence, the Founder Jinnah died which caused great loss. Bureaucrats entered in circles of power and they created political disruption and change of one government after another government. There was political chaos and instability. No sustainable plan was chalked out by the democratic governments during 1947-1958. There was no proper planning for long term programme for social and economic development. One Unit caused inter-provincial disharmony. Hatred grew among masses. Feelings of disparity and differences arose among provinces against unequal and unjust policies of the central government. There was food shortage. People of Pakistan faced poverty and hunger. There was political ups and downs and violence. After nine years of independence the 1956 Constitution was put into force but within two years it was abrogated through declaring the Martial Law on 7<sup>th</sup> October in 1958.

From October 1958 to June 1962 there was Martial Law under President Ayub. Law and order was maintained in Martial Law period. For uplifting social and economic development new reforms were launched. Ayub gave the Presidential system through implementing Constitution of 1962. In 1965 Ayub Khan's victory in presidential election created doubts among the masses about government's claims of transparency and fairness. Measures were taken for developing economy and developing institutions but the policies were not sided in line with the wishes of the common masses. Provinces were not given their due share in the

federation. Opposition was not respected. General elections were not held during Ayub rule. Anti-Ayub Movement of 1968-1969 caused political disturbance. And Army Chief General Yahya took the power in March 1969. After 1970 General elections the violence spread out in Eastern Wing and Pakistan was disintegrated in December 1971 due to Indian aggression. Less attention was paid for establishing the good governance.

### **References**

- Ahmed, V. (2017). *Pakistan's Agenda for Economic Reforms*. Karachi, Oxford University Press.
- Ali, S. A. (2003). *Pakistan Issues of Government and Politics*. Lahore, Fiction House.
- Husain, I. (2011). *Pakistan the Economy of an Elitist State*. Karachi, Oxford University Press.
- Husain, I. (2018). *Governing the Ungovernable: Institutional Reforms for Democratic Governance*. Karachi, Oxford University Press.
- Hussain, J. (2017). *A History of the Peoples of Pakistan Towards Independence*. Karachi, Oxford University Press.
- Jalal, A. (2016). *The Oxford Companion to Pakistani History*. Karachi, Oxford University Press.
- Kaleem, D. M. (2016). *Governance and Public Policies*. Lahore, Jahangir's World Times Publications.
- Khan, H. (2016). *Constitutional and Political History of Pakistan*. Karachi, Oxford University Press.
- Lodhi, M. (2016). *Pakistan Beyond the 'Crisis State'*. Karachi, Oxford University Press.
- Munir, M. (1980). *From Jinnah to Zia*. Lahore, Vanguard Books Ltd. Davis Road.
- Rizvi, H. A. (2000). *The Military and Politics in Pakistan: 1947-1997*. Lahore, Sang-e-Meel Publications.
- Shahid, A. H. (1995). *The Economy of Pakistan*. Lahore, Ilmi Kitab Khana, Kabir Street, Urdu Bazar.
- Siddiqui, S. (2017). *Education Policies in Pakistan: Politics, Projections, and Practices*. Karachi, Oxford University Press.

- Smith, N. (2009). *Pakistan, History, Culture and Government*. Karachi, Oxford University Press.