

# MOBILITY PATTERNS INTERLOCKED BY THE PERPETUAL FEAR OF CASTE, GENDER, AND RELIGION

Ayra Indrias Patras\*

## Abstract

*Mobility, either for work or leisure, is a fundamental right that needs to be accorded to all, irrespective of differences based on class, gender, religion, and other identity markers. When this right to mobility is eclipsed by disparities and discrimination for people situated differently or marked by their exclusive characteristics, it calls attention to dwell upon a better meaning of mobility and investigate how mobility interrelates with gender, work, and society. Exercising the right to mobility is contingent upon class differences, caste-based occupations, gender preferences, urban infrastructure, and access to transportation. Therefore, the present study attempts to examine the mobility patterns of working-class women of the Christian minority community in Lahore by not restricting the understanding of physical mobility to everyday commuting for work, rather it brings into light a varied dimension of mobility terrains. Applying in-depth interviews as a qualitative research tool, 11 interviews of Christian women belong to working classes were conducted. Of all, 7 worked as domestic workers and 4 as security guards. By listening voices of minority women from the margins about their situated realities, the study deliberated on how mobility reconfigures with exclusive identity markers, such as spatial marginality, caste-based occupation, gender, class, and religion. The exploration of the concerns and constraints of women regarding their mobility concerns aims at facilitating an understanding as well as to recognizing uneven layers of mobility that expand the understanding of mobility, defined or understood, by people living in poor settlements.*

**Keywords:** *Mobility, Minority, Gender, Rights, Discrimination*

## INTRODUCTION

The nature of social stratification and inequalities in society is related to the differences in the understanding of mobility patterns as often debated by social scientists, policymakers, social reformers, and political leaders. Mobility to access economic avenues is a significant conduit to gain meaningful participation in the labour force. A study on womens access to public transport in Lahore reported an alarming situation in terms of women's

---

\*Dr .Ayra Indrias Patras is Assistant Professor at Forman Christian College University Lahore

safety in public transport and on the roads that not only contribute to the already existing patriarchal restrictions on women but rather constrain their opportunities to get involved in public life and economic activity (Aurat Foundation, 2018). Article 34 of the Constitution of Pakistan ensures full participation of women in national life irrespective of gender differences and places a legal obligation on the state towards the realization of a safe and protected public environment for women. However, mobility, constrained by gender disparities provides limited or no access to women to gain information and avail benefits from the available opportunities leaving grave implications on the lives of women in their journey towards attaining economic progress. Mobility for leisure is also essential for garnering social and psychological emotional equilibrium that needs to be availed without any encumbrances, but the fear, insecurity, and non-availability of inclusive infrastructure impede the right to seek pleasure in public spaces. Ole B. Jensen emphasized upon the re-conceptualization of mobility and infrastructures as sites of meaningful interactions, pleasure, and cultural reproduction (Jensen, 2009).

The patriarchal social mores and feudalistic societies prefer women to remain confined to private domains, thereby, restricting their right to independently move around in public spheres. Another study that underscored the nature and types of street harassment found that visual harassment including ogling, leering, gesticulating, and staring, is quite common in Pakistan, which severely acts as a hindrance for women to seek educational pursuits (Ahmed, Yousaf, & Asif, 2019). This study highlights that even educated teachers are of the view that the best response to the harasser is to ignore, thereby, a majority of women do not report to police authorities. Whatever the type of harassment women face, either physical or verbal, victims mostly prefer to keep silent thinking it will dishonor their family name if they report it. Many do not know the person who inflicts harassment that further keeps them silent, which explains that little recourse is available for the victims of street harassment in public spaces (Azeem, 2018). The constant feeling of being unsafe in public spaces perpetuates the sense of displeasure and disapproval leaving far-reaching implications on the psychological and emotional wellbeing of women.

While deliberating on the responses of women of the marginalized minority community on the question of their physical mobility, whose hard realities are also eclipsed by social boundaries determined by class, caste, and religion, my study foregrounds that restricted mobility leads to the internalization of perpetual fear of alienation from the larger society that also

impedes and incapacitates women from utilizing their full potential. Patriarchal challenges in their private homes coupled with caste hierarchies and occupation-based discrimination entail mobility barriers on multiple counts. Such societal mores promote and propagate misogynist discourse, which sanctions that women's security is ensured only in private and protected domains within the confines of four walls of home and hearth.

## **LITERATURE REVIEW**

In a developing country like Pakistan, familial and social control over women is exercised by the preponderance of social norms and more of *Purdah* and *Izzat* (honor) that characterize differential access to educational and supportive services available to males and females (Roomi & Parrott, 2008). The study on socio-cultural factors affecting women's economic participation highlighted that educational barriers, and limited access to income, property, resources, and restricted mobility obstruct women's economic empowerment (Choudhry, Mutalib, & Ismail, 2019). However, women are not a homogeneous category as they are differently situated by class, caste, religion, and gender. Little academic attention is drawn to investigate how women of poor working class or religious minorities navigate their mobility pathways for their meagre earnings amid several challenges stemming from socio-religious inequalities.

The Pakistani Christians consist of diverse ethnic groups but their overwhelming majority comes from the Punjabi lineage. According to the 2017 census, Christians make up about 1.59 percent of the total population (Pakistan Bureau of Statistics, 2017), who are mainly concentrated in the Punjab Province. This census has ranked the Christian population at 2.3 percent of the total 100 million population of Punjab. Christians are nearly 5 percent of the total population of 11.280 million in Lahore (District Lahore Government of the Punjab, 2017). Hindus and Sikhs are in smaller numbers, whereas the overwhelming population of the religious minorities in Lahore are Christians. Punjabi Christians are mainly the descendants of the *Chura* caste (O'Brien, 2012), who were converted by Western missionaries to Christianity from 1870 to 1920. However, this religious conversion did not make a dent in the old-age caste-based prejudices and discriminations, ascribed to Christians in Pakistan due to their ancestral and present-day occupation of waste removal/cleaning profession. Rammanohar Lohia foregrounded that what distinguishes caste from class was the immobility that had imbued into class relationships, and the inability of an individual to move upwards into a higher caste, improved status and income emphasizing

that class was mobile and caste was immobile (Kumar, 2010).

Several Christian settlements in Lahore depict scenes of urban slum dwellings with poor sanitation and lack of basic amenities and are mostly situated in the back streets. Living conditions in a poor Christian ghetto itself speak of spatial marginality their residents suffer.

Poor Christian women can visibly be seen working as domestic workers/house helpers in Lahore. Women of this group are often looked down upon due to their low socio-economic position and nature of work and are often ridiculed by derogatory names such as jamadars, mehtars, and sweepers (Shahid 2010). Highlighting the precarious working conditions of domestic workers in Pakistan, who are not protected by the labour laws, Ayesha Shahid argued that domestic work itself is perceived as devalued, derogated, and unrecognized which explains the role of class, ethnicity, and gender placed domestic service at the bottom of the employment ladder (Ayesha Shahid, 2009). Furthermore, Ayesha Shahid also stressed that the earning capacity of women domestic workers does not bring any noticeable change in the gender hierarchies and social power relations in domestic spheres. Christian domestic workers manage not only the double burden of working inside and outside, but they also have to put up with their stigmatized religious and low caste identity at the workplaces that also constrain mobility in their career choices.

Women's work remains invisible in many other informal sectors including casual work, labour in family enterprises, unskilled work in houses, and also lack potential upward mobility in their occupational careers (Sadaquat & Sheikh, 2011). There has been an increased share of women's work in the productive economy, however, this work is unrecognized and also marred by poor working conditions (Hassan & Azman, 2014).

Pakistani women have had legal protection by a law titled Protection against Harassment of Women at Workplaces since 2010. This law explicitly covers harassment occurring in workplaces and different kinds of work arrangements, but, harassment on the streets and roads inflicted upon women is not covered under the said act. Several organizations and human rights activists have been actively involved in tackling the issues of sexual harassment at the workplace but little attention is given to the street harassment women in Pakistan are facing and little work is done in exploring and understanding this issue (Ahmed, Yousaf, & Asif, 2019). Under Article 509 of the Pakistan Penal Code, offenders of harassment in streets, parks, and markets can be legally tried and can be awarded punishment extended

up to 3 years of imprisonment or a fine of Rs. 500,000 or both. Seeking legal recourse for this kind of harassment seems impossible because, many times, men pass ridiculing remarks, grope women walking on the streets, and run away on motorbikes. Although the Punjab Government under its program of Punjab Safe City Authority has installed cameras to ensure public safety their focus is more confined towards tracing terrorist activities instead of following cases of harassment against women on roads and streets. In the year 2020, the Government of Punjab introduced an online safety application for women to ensure their safety on streets and roads as they need to push buttons in case of any danger and threats they encounter on public roads, which will directly connect to the police helpline. It seems that such a device is only used by literate women, who are well conversant with using electronic technology.

Poor urban planning along with a non-conducive environment such as lack of proper lights, absence of pedestrian pathways, unhygienic and unclean wagons and buses offering cheap travel fare, and long waiting times for transportation further compound and constrain mobility for women. Lahore has also witnessed the introduction of private car companies through online booking. However, women of the working classes cannot afford private car services or rickshaws which again hinders their access to gainful economic and educational opportunities. Using different kinds of transport commensurate with the economic affordability of women situated differently across class divides is another grave anomaly. Some private companies with the support of the government initiated pink bus services exclusively offering services to women commuters, however, such buses are very few therefore their outreach is limited to a few routes only.

## **METHODOLOGY**

The present study examines how mobility patterns of working-class women of the Christian minority community in Lahore, are determined by their identity markers of low caste, poor class, and minority religion. The methodology is situated in the qualitative domain. Apart from participant observation, Researcher has applied in-depth interviews as a research tool to elicit responses from the participants believing that social meanings are embedded in the lived conditions. Sharing the same religious identity with the participants proved advantageous for researcher as participants were at ease in discussing problems with co-religionists. Researcher own working experience of 14 years with a poor Christian community in Punjab facilitated in approaching the participants. To eradicate personal biases, researcher

adopted reflexivity in this analysis phase and improved the validity of the participants' responses by conducting repeated interviews and cross-checking with them.

In addition to relying on secondary sources such as research studies and newspaper articles, researcher interviewed 11 women of working classes of 2 localities in Lahore namely Basti Sadan Shah Mia Mir and Marzipura Colony, Ravi Road. These settlements are mostly inhabited by the Christian community giving a picture of a ghettoized enclave. Among the interviewees, 7 were domestic workers and 4 were employed as security guards in private organizations. The reason for selecting the minority Christian community as a focused group stems from the observation that Lahore city encompasses closely knitted Christian *basis*/ poor slums situated at the peripheries of the city or margins of posh and affluent localities and housing schemes. Ghettoized living of Christians in poor slums in Lahore, itself calls attention to probe into the dichotomy of space inside and outside the community. These slums also serve the purpose of supplying cheap labour to affluent households as informal labour and women are engaged in the service sector such as waste removal, domestic house help, patient carer, etc.

Residents of poor slums encounter multiple strands of marginality based on poor class, subservient gender, and minority religion. Contemplating the plight of Dalit women in India, who are largely segregated and socially ostracized, discriminated against based on class, gender, and caste, Partha Chatterjee emphasized that the sharp distinctions based on actual life conditions and experiences of women of different social categories are simply glossed over (Chatterjee, 2014). Therefore, it is pertinent to critically examine the experiences of low-caste Christian women to unveil the barriers in public spaces as well as emphasize the resilience these brave poor women build to cope with everyday harassment and exploitation. The present study explores the challenges of mobility these women encounter in their daily life experiences not only limited to their workplaces, rather, but it also unveils the understanding of mobility perceived by women at the margins vis a vis unfolding how mobility is characterized by class, caste, gender, and religion.

## **FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS**

### **Spatial Marginality**

The traditional understanding of marginality confines its meaning to economic deprivation in which a region seems to be marginal when it is away

from the market and is not autonomous economically and politically. However, this understanding is critiqued by Postmodernists, who view marginality as a social construction with multiple reference points pivoted around power centers based on the characteristics of gender, religion, language, and occupation that led to spatial marginalization of groups, who live in ghettos or enclaves and are excluded from the privileged space (Cullen & Pretes, 2000). Geographical marginality has implications on mobility terrain towards socio-economic opportunities and advancements.

Caste additionally interacts with class, gender, religion, regional identities, and migration histories to shape the life opportunities and outcomes of individuals in the city (Singh, Vithayathil, Pradhan, 2019). Subjected to the historical trajectory of caste-based discrimination coupled with religious and class prejudices (O'Brien, 2012) Pakistani Christians are left with minimal or very few opportunities for social interactions with the majority community at large which entails the likelihood of exercising their free residential mobility. Analyzing the lives of Black Africans in segregated ghettos, it is explained that blacks are significantly worse off in segregated communities than in non-segregated communities as integration is correlated with success (Cutler & Glaeser, 1995).

Perpetual feelings of insecurity on account of minority religion, fear from the majority Muslim community, and internalized perception of being other or lesser citizens are a few reasons given by Christians when asked as to why they prefer to live with their co-religionists. As echoed in the words of a woman.

It is better to live with our people, we can freely practice our religious prayers, celebrate Christmas, and help each other. Muslims do not like us so why to live and make relations with them? When I leave for work, I can easily leave my two young daughters with my Christian neighbors, otherwise, it would be very difficult for me to work had I been living in a Muslim neighborhood (Sumera, personal communication, May, 5, 2020, Lahore).

As the urban poor have become socially and spatially isolated from the larger society, resultantly, worse consequences of poverty dwelled upon them, which made it more difficult to build social capital in such an environment (Bridger & Alter, 2006).

### **Intergenerational Occupational Immobility**

The individual's social status is dynamically determined by several elements, such as religion, caste, or gender causing intergenerational inequalities and discrimination (Kabir, Maitrot, Ali, Farhana, & Criel, 2018). Christians of low castes have been overwhelmingly concentrated in the janitorial and sanitation services, which is characterized by unequal caste-like relations, well observed by several social scientists and researchers (Beall, 2006), (O'Brien, 2012), (Aqeel, 2015). The findings of my doctoral dissertation reported that around 80 to 90 percent of sweepers working in various public departments of Lahore belong to the Christian community (Patras, 2020). It also found out that the job advertisement policy that prefers Christians for low-scale menial and cleaning work is implemented in the government departments. Job vacancies that categorically call Christians to apply for the post of sweepers have been repeatedly issued by government departments.

Interviewees of the present study also informed that their ancestors have been closely associated with the cleaning occupations. This intergenerational occupational immobility points out the relevance of caste with occupational mobility. As a result, it disadvantages low caste groups from seeking access to higher work avenues. Rajeshwari Deshpande and Suhas Palshikar found out that upward movement in an occupational category is much more strongly tied with caste (Deshpande & Palshikar, 2008).

In the hierarchy of occupational prestige, a cleaner is devalued and despised more than a driver, gardener, or cook/chef. As echoed in the words of a woman, who was working as a domestic cleaner.

We Christian women are not allowed to cook food for Muslim employers, enter their kitchens, or touch their utensils. My landlady keeps a separate food pot for me for a meal but a Muslim worker can cook for her. Our Muslim employers think we are dirty people (Shama, personal communication, August 29, 2020, Lahore)

The reduced sense of self-worth in Christians stems from the wounded experiences of discrimination routinely faced by them. Corroborating with theoretical nuances of intersectionality (Crenshaw,) the lived realities of Christian women reinforce that social divisions based on religion, caste, class, and gender bias shape peoples' subjective realities and synergies that in turn lead to disadvantages, discrimination, and social alienation. The public discourse on caste-based discrimination has not gained much attention



in academia, whereas, the exclusionary practices against marginalized groups are conspicuously prevalent. Harris Guzdar pointed out that sharing meals or utensils with people of low caste is not socially acceptable (Guzdar, 2007).

Linda S Wallbridge views that this kind of marginalization is embodied in layers of caste, community, and kinship hierarchies that make poor Christians more vulnerable to exploitation. (Wallbridge, 2003). Jennifer Jag Jivan and Peter Jacob argued that working-class women belonging to both Christian and Hindu communities face double discrimination and exploitation from the majority community at the workplace on account of their gender and religious minority group. (Jag-Jeevan & Jacob, 2012).

### **Deprivation of Social Capital**

Social interactions lead to building social capital which is a necessary determinant of socio-economic prosperity. Theorizing about social capital, Robert D Putnam argued that diminished social capital means that the interactions between the majority and disadvantaged minority involve higher transaction costs than similar transactions among people with greater mutual respect and trust (Putnam, 2000). The lack of social cohesion and communal polarization based on religion, gender, and caste create distrust among diverse communities that further leads to ghettoization and enclaved living marked by social identities. It also reinforces immobilization and restricts interactions beyond communities of the same faith. It is further attested by a woman, who was working as a security guard in a college.

I am very thankful to God that I got a job in a Christian college where I can work with my people, trust them, and share my issues with no hesitation and I don't feel any kind of fear from my people (Ruksana, personal communication, June, 2, 2020, Lahore).

A disadvantaged minority identity and the situated reality of living in poor slums reproduce and reinforce restricted mobility patterns for Christian women in the socio-economic, cultural, and political spheres of society.

### **Abuses and Sexual Slurs for Low-Caste Women**

Lewd and derogatory comments from strangers on the roads are commonly heard by women while they commute to and from work, as told by a domestic worker,

I feel embarrassed and stressed when males use abusive language that names women's genital parts while I walk toward the bus stop to get to work. Sexual slurs are also used for Christian women such as *churi* and *garam*(hot). (Mehak, personal communication, July, 16, 2020, Lahore).

These commonly used epithets/stereotypes are hurled to ridicule and despise Christians. Maryam Mirza observed that the acts of sexual exploitation of untouchable/lower caste women by upper-caste men, whether in India or Pakistan, whether forced or otherwise are considered so insignificant and socially inconsequential that they do not represent a challenge to, or violation of the templates of ritual pollution (Mirza, 2015). Mirza further elaborated that though *chura* women are considered “impure” for social interaction, nonetheless, these women are touched, groped, and molested by men of upper caste.

While many Christian women have relatively progressed and joined professions other than waste removal, however, the scars of historically ascribed caste-fueled stigmatization still haunt them. As experienced by a woman, who was working as a security guard in a private college.

Once I was heading towards the bus stop from my home, the moment I left my Christian neighborhood, a group of Muslim boys standing at the corner of the street next to the bus stop said, “Look *churi* is wearing a dark color”, I pretended to ignore as I was getting late from my work and did not want to waste my time because these people keep saying such things (Agnas, personal communication, August, 2, 2020, Lahore)

It is not only the physical mobility that is constrained on account of gender, rather the caste-ascribed confinement to ghettoized living entails multiple reference points of oppression these Christian working women are confronted with. Positioned at the lower rung of the social order marked by divisions based on class, caste, gender, and religion, these Christian women navigate through uneven terrain and internalize such oppression in exchange for their freedom of movement, which is otherwise curtailed and eclipsed. Drawing inferences from the theory of intersectionality while listening to the constraints faced by Christian women sweepers in Lahore, I and Ahmad Usman observed that unequal social divisions intersect to increase and internalize double disadvantages and discrimination among the marginalized groups of the society (Patras and Usman, 2019). Theoretical nuances of double jeopardy espoused by women of color foregrounded that minority

women face a double whammy of discrimination and prejudice based on their being women and minorities (Berdahl & Moore, 2006).

### **Infrastructural Moorings Causing Mobility Constraints**

Iris Marion Young highlighted that women are denied both culturally and socially their subjectivity, autonomy, and creativity which are definitive of human beings whereas such freedoms are accorded to men in patriarchal societies but tensions are manifested in female bodily compartments, motility, and spatiality (Young, 1980). While working with poor Christian women in community based projects in Punjab, I observed, many times, that young girls in the age bracket from 13 to 25 often bent inward their shoulders to hide their breasts while walking which leads to poor posture of their body compartments.

Fearing unwanted sexual overtures, women manage stress and tension as they walk on the roads which reflects in their constricted body compartment. It is further seconded by a woman,

Walking on the roads is not easy as men keep staring no matter how much we cover our bodies, most of the time I walk fast to avoid hearing bad comments from men, who often hurl derogatory words at unaccompanied women (Tasleem, August, 22, 2020, Lahore)

Lack of proper street lights near slums, absence of pedestrian pathways, and heaps of garbage scattered around poor localities further compound women's access to public space. Report on challenges faced by women in accessing public transport by an NGO Aurat Foundation in Lahore attested that several cases of sexual harassment reported by women occurred more in deserted streets than at the bus stops (Aurat Foundation, 2018). After analyzing 6 localities of Lahore, this report also highlighted that Kot Lakhpath, a Christian settlement had a greater number of police-reported cases registered by women victims of sexual harassment on streets that includes touching, physical attacks, abusive language, obscene gestures, whistling, staring, singing and leering. Echoing similar complaints, a woman security guard explained.

Hearing abusive and sexual comments early in the morning keeps my mood off throughout the day. Sometimes I respond to them but fighting every day with such rascals makes me tired. Once I was walking back from my workplace when two young boys on a motorbike touched my bottom and ran away (Nazia,

August, 26, 2020, Lahore).

### **Control of physical mobility due to fear of religious conversion**

Religious conversions of young Christian girls to Islam is a common practice, though being frowned upon by the patriarchs of the Christian community, who blame Muslims for forcibly converting Christian girls to Islam and marrying them off to Muslim boys. I have found that several cases involving marriages of Christian girls with Muslim boys after girls go through religious conversion to Islam, were challenged in the court of law by parents of Christian girls but Christian girls testify confidently before the courts that they embraced Islam and married to Muslim men by exercising their free choice (Patras, 2020). I keep hearing such stories of Christian girls among my acquaintances that they marry Muslim men of means to escape their poverty, convert to Islam, and abandon their Christian faith.

Fearing religious conversion of young girls, family patriarchs of the Christian community prefer to marry their daughters at an early age within their relatives and also control their physical movement by restricting their access to college and university education. For a different research study, I interviewed women of a small Sikh community in Lahore. I was told that girls do not get permission from their parents for college education because the parents think that if their daughters access higher education, they will meet Muslim men and could be converted to Islam (Patras, 2021). This communal friction and social alienation between the majority Muslims and minority communities in Pakistan further reinforce patriarchal controls on women's mobility.

### **CONCLUSION**

Poverty-induced economic participation has pushed many working-class women into the informal sector where they not only face violations in terms of their working rules, regulations, and conditions but additionally bear the brunt of non-conducive public spaces encountering derogatory remarks, lewd comments, catcalling, taunting voices often hurled at unaccompanied women on roads and streets. While investigating the mobility barriers faced by women of marginalized communities, our understanding of mobility should not be limited to the physical aspect instead the article sheds light on the expanded definition of mobility and discusses the multiple strands of mobility characterized by gender, caste, and religion, which eclipse socio-cultural transactions and restrict avenues for economic opportunities. In a society, where religion, caste, and gender divides crystalize socio-economic

and religio-cultural cleavages and fissures, mobility patterns of marginalized communities get constricted. The inter-generational association of Christians with menial occupation of waste removal due to their lower caste, poor class, and minority religion further excludes them from accessing upward socio-economic mobility. Furthermore, In families, patriarchal control on women against socializing with men of other religions stems from inter-communal and religious hostilities. Similarly, men of the dominant group/community feel pride in converting women of minority communities to their faith by marrying them off and making them abandon their parents and relatives. The structural violence characterized by socio-religious exclusion inhibits women's potential to earn a dignified living. The growing bigotry and socio-religious intolerance instill fear in the minority community and limit their social interactions with the outside community.

## REFERENCES

- Ahmed, B., Yousaf, F. N., & Asif, U.-E.-R. (2019). Combating Street Harassment: A Challenge for Pakistan. *Women & Criminal Justice*, 1–11. doi: 10.1080/08974454.2019.1644697
- Aqeel, A. (2015, October 23). Christians Required Only as Sweepers. *The Friday Times*. Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan
- Aurat Foundation. (2018). *Women's Safety Audit in Public Transport in Lahore. Women's Safety Audit in Public Transport in Lahore* (pp. 1–140). Lahore, Punjab: Women Development Department Punjab, Aurat Foundation, UN Women Pakistan.
- Ayesha Shahid. (2009 Issue 1). The Socio-Legal Implications of Women's Work in the Informal Sector: A Case Study of Women Domestic. *Law, Social Justice & Global Development*, 1-22.
- Azeem, T. (2018, August 31). Street Harassment in Pakistan. Retrieved December 19, 2019, from <https://thediplomat.com/2018/08/street-harassment-in-pakistan/>.
- Berdahl, J. L., & Moore, C. (2006). Minority Women Face Double Jeopardy in the Workplace. *PsycEXTRA Dataset*, 426–436. doi: 10.1037/e674022007-006
- Bridger, J. C., & Alter, T. R. (2006). Place, Community Development, and Social Capital. *Community Development*, 37(1), 5–18. doi: 10.1080/15575330609490151

- Chatterjee, D. (2014). Dalit Women and the Public Sphere in India In Pursuit of Social Justice. In S. Bagchi, *Beyond the Private World: Indian Women in the Public Sphere* (pp. 168-182). Primus Books.
- Choudhry, A. N., Mutalib, R. A., & Ismail, N. S. A. (2019). Socio-Cultural factors affecting Women's Economic Empowerment in Pakistan: A Situation Analysis. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 9(5), 90–102. doi: 10.6007/ijarbss/v9-i5/5842
- Cullen, B. T., & Pretes, M. (2000). The meaning of marginality: Interpretations and perceptions in social science. *The Social Science Journal*, 37(2), 215–229. doi: 10.1016/s0362-3319(00)00056-2
- Cutler, D. M., & Glaeser, E. M. (1995, June). Are Ghettos Good or Bad? *Working Paper No 5163*. Cambridge, Massachusetts Avenue, United States of America: National Bureau of Economic Research.
- Deshpande, R., & Palshikar, S. (2008). Occupational Mobility: How Much Does Caste Matter? *Economic and Political Weekly*, 43(34), 61–70.
- District Lahore Government of the Punjab. (n.d.). *Area and population*. Lahore. [https://lahore.punjab.gov.pk/area\\_population](https://lahore.punjab.gov.pk/area_population)
- Jeevan, J. J., & Jacob, P. (2012). *Life on the Margins*. Lahore: Sanjh Publications.
- Jensen, O. B. (2009). Flows of Meaning, Cultures of Movements – Urban Mobility as Meaningful Everyday Life
- Jensen, O. B. (2009). Flows of meaning, cultures of movements–urban mobility as meaningful everyday life practice. *Mobilities*, 4(1), 139-158.
- Kabir, A., Maitrot, M. R. L., Ali, A., Farhana, N., & Criel, B. (2018). A qualitative exploration of sociocultural determinants of health inequities of Dalit population in Dhaka City, Bangladesh. *BMJ Open*, 8(12), 1–13. doi: 10.1136/bmjopen-2018-022906
- Kumar, A. (2010). Understanding Lohia's Political Sociology: Intersectionality of Caste, Class, Gender and Language. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 45(40), 64–70.

- O'Brien, J. (2012). *The unconquered people: the liberation journey of an oppressed caste*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Pakistan Bureau of Statistics, "Table 9 - Population by Sex, Religion and Rural/Urban Area / Sex ... - PBS" (2017) <<https://www.pbs.gov.pk/sites/default/files/population/2017/tables/pakistan/Table09n.pdf>>
- Patras I. Ayra & Usman, A. (2019). Intersection of Gender, Work and Caste: The Case of Christian Female Sweepers of Lahore. *Journal of the Research Society of Pakistan* 56 (2), 363-373
- Patras, A. I. (2020). *Perspectives from the Margins: A Case of Christian Female Sweepers in Lahore* (dissertation). The University of Punjab, Lahore, Lahore, Pakistan.
- Patras, A. I. (2021). Intersectional Challenges faced by Christian Women in Interfaith Marriages: JRS. *Journal of Research Society of Pakistan*, 58, 75–83.
- Putnam, R.D., 2000. *Bowling alone: the collapse and revival of American community*. New York: Simon & Schuster.
- Sadaquat, M. B., & Sheikh, Q. T. A. A. (2011). Employment situation of women in Pakistan. *International Journal of Social Economics*, 38(2), 98–113. doi: 10.1108/03068291111091981
- Singh, G., Vithayathil, T., & Pradhan, K. C. (2019). *Recasting inequality: residential segregation by caste over time in urban India*. *Environment and Urbanization*, 095624781881233. doi:10.1177/0956247818812330
- Walbridge, L. S. (2009). *Christians of Pakistan: the passion of bishop john joseph*. Place of publication not identified: Routledge.
- Young, I. M. (1980). Throwing like a girl: A phenomenology of feminine body comportment motility and spatiality. *Human Studies*, 3(1), 137–156. doi: 10.1007/bf02331805.